

DOKUZ EYLÜL UNIVERSITY
GRADUATE SCHOOL OF SOCIAL SCIENCES
DEPARTMENT OF INTERNATIONAL RELATIONS
MASTER’S THESIS

TOWARDS AN IMPROVED UNDERSTANDING OF THE
VATICAN’S INFLUENCE IN WORLD POLITICS:
PAST, PROVENANCE AND PROCESS

John ADDO-OBIRI

Supervisor

Ass. Prof. Dr. Sevilay Z. AKSOY

IZMIR - 2016

DECLARATION

I hereby declare that this master's thesis / project titled as "TOWARDS AN IMPROVED UNDERSTANDING OF THE VATICAN'S INFLUENCE IN WORLD POLITICS: PAST, PROVENANCE AND PROCESS" has been written by myself in accordance with the academic rules and ethical conduct. I also declare that all materials benefited in this thesis consist of the mentioned resources in the reference list. I verify all these with my honour.

...../...../.....

John ADDO-OBIRI

ABSTRACT

Master's Thesis

Towards An Improved Understanding of the Vatican's Influence in World

Politics: Past, Provenance and Process

John ADDO-OBIRI

Dokuz Eylül University

Graduate School of Social Sciences

Department of International Relations

Master's Program

The objective of this thesis is directed towards improving an understanding of the Vatican's influence in world politics. This is done by focussing on the three key areas of *Past*, *Provenance* and *Process*, whilst utilizing an eclectic approach that remains within the boundaries of a liberal/constructivist framework, where soft power theory forms a basis for explanations. In line with constructivism's emphasis on the importance of history, *Past* provides a historical background that is subsequently linked to *Provenance's* investigations into the sources of the Vatican's soft power. Finally, *Process* addresses this thesis' primary case study by asking the question of 'How/In what way did the Vatican influence the recent thaw in U.S.-Cuban relations?'. Ultimately, it is revealed that; the relations of admiration and respect generated from the Vatican's positive image had placed it in a favourable position to effectively initiate a series of conciliatory moves which encouraged dialogue and supported progression on the removal of the (interrelated) economic, humanitarian, ideological and diplomatic barriers that had previously dominated Cuban-U.S. relations, thereby contributing towards a thaw in relations between the two nations.

Keywords: Vatican, Holy See, influence, Pope, soft power, U.S.-Cuba thaw

ÖZET
Yüksek Lisans Tezi
Dünya Politikasındaki Vatikan Nüfuzunu Daha
İyi Anlamak: Geçmiş, Kaynaklar ve Süreç
John ADDO-OBIRI

Dokuz Eylül University
Sosyal Bilimler Enstitüsü
Uluslararası İlişkiler Anabilim Dalı
Yüksek Lisans Programı

Bu tezin amacı Vatikan'ın dünya siyasetindeki nüfuzunu daha iyi anlamaya yöneliktir. Bu ise *Geçmiş*, *Köken* ve *Süreç* kilit alanlarına odaklanarak ve yumuşak güç kuramının açıklamalar için temel teşkil ettiği liberal/inşacı bir kuramsal çerçevenin sınırları içinde kalan bir eklektik yaklaşımdan yararlanarak gerçekleştirilmektedir. İnşacılığın tarihin önemine yaptığı vurgu doğrultusunda, *Geçmiş*, *Köken'in* Vatikan'ın yumuşak güç kaynaklarını incelemelerine ilişkin tarihi bir arka plan sunmaktadır. Son olarak, *Süreç* bu tezin başlıca vaka çalışmasını, 'Nasıl/Ne şekilde Vatikan, A.B.D.-Küba ilişkilerinde son zamanlarda görülen yumuşamayı etkiledi?' sorusunu sorarak ele almaktadır. En son olarak, Vatikan'ın olumlu imajından kaynaklanan takdir ve saygıya dayanan ilişkilerin Vatikan'a, daha önce Küba-A.B.D. ilişkilerine damgasını vurmuş (birbiriyle ilişkili) ekonomik, insani, ideolojik ve diplomatik engellerin kaldırılmasına yönelik ilerlenme sağlanmasını destekleyen ve diyalogu teşvik eden bir dizi uzlaştırıcı adımı etkili olarak başlatma ve böylece iki ulus arasındaki ilişkilerin yakınlaşmasına katkıda bulunan elverişli bir pozisyon kazandırmış olduğu ortaya konmaktadır.

Anahtar kelimeler: Vatikan, Papalık, nüfuz, Papa, yumuşak güç, A.B.D.-Küba yakınlaşması.

**TOWARDS AN IMPROVED UNDERSTANDING OF THE VATICAN'S
INFLUENCE IN WORLD POLITICS: PAST, PROVENANCE AND
PROCESS**

CONTENTS

MASTER'S THESIS APPROVAL PAGE	ii
DECLARATION	iii
ABSTRACT (ENGLISH)	iv
ABSTRACT (TURKISH)	v
CONTENTS	vi
ABBREVIATIONS	ix
INTRODUCTION	1

CHAPTER 1

THEORETICAL FRAMEWORK AND METHODOLOGY

1.1	LIBERALISM	5
1.1.1	The Three Core Assumptions of Liberal Theories	7
1.1.2	Ideational Liberalism	10
1.1.3	Soft Power	11
1.2	CONSTRUCTIVISM	13
1.2.1	Constructivism's Three Core Ontological Propositions about Social Life	14
1.3	METHOD AND CONTENT	15
1.3.1	Past: A Historical Background	16
1.3.2	Provenance: Sources of the Vatican's Influence	16
1.3.3	Process: A Case Study of the Vatican's Role in the U.S.-Cuban Thaw	21

CHAPTER 2: *PAST*
A HISTORICAL BACKGROUND

2.1	POPE PIUS XI (1922-1939)	26
2.2	POPE PIUS XII (1939-1958)	27
2.3	POPE JOHN XXIII (1958-1963)	28
2.4	POPE PAUL VI (1963-1978)	29
2.5	POPE JOHN PAUL II (1978-2005)	31
2.6	POPE BENEDICT XVI (2005-2013)	33

CHAPTER 3: *PROVENANCE*
SOURCES OF THE VATICAN'S INFLUENCE

3.1	THE PRINCIPLES OF CATHOLIC SOCIAL DOCTRINE	35
3.2	CULTURE	39
3.2.1	The Church's Social Teaching as a Manifestation of Catholic Culture	39
3.2.2	Lifestyle	42
3.2.3	Visits and Personal Contact	45
3.3	INSTITUTIONS	46
3.4	A RESPECT FOR INTERNATIONAL LAW, NORMS & INSTITUTIONS	49
3.5	A FUNDAMENTAL RELIANCE ON MULTILATERALISM	51
3.6	A GLOBAL WORLDVIEW: EMPHASIS ON THE SHARED PROMOTION OF THE WELFARE OF THE INTERNATIONAL COMMUNITY	53

CHAPTER 4: *PROCESS*
A CASE STUDY OF THE VATICAN’S ROLE IN THE
U.S.-CUBAN THAW

4.1	A BRIEF HISTORY OF U.S.-CUBAN RELATIONS	57
4.2	CONTENT ANALYSIS	60
4.2.1	The “Interest of the Citizens of Both Countries”	61
4.2.2	“Humanitarian Questions of Common Interest”	64
4.2.3	“A New Phase in Relations between Both Parties”	66
4.2.4	Facilitation of a “Constructive Dialogue on Delicate Matters”	68
4.3	PROCESS TRACING	69
4.3.1	John Paul II and Benedict Set the Stage for Francis	70
4.3.2	Obama and Francis Meet for the First Time	71
4.3.3	Francis Writes Letters to Obama and Castro	71
4.3.4	The Vatican Hosts U.S. and Cuban Delegations	72
4.3.5	The U.S. Requests Vatican’s Assistance on Humanitarian Issues for “Current Inmates”	72
4.3.6	The Ice Begins to Melt	73
4.3.7	Relations between the U.S. and Cuba Continue to Thaw	74
4.3.8	The Vatican Announces That Francis Will Visit Cuba On His Way to the U.S	75
4.3.9	Francis Holds Private Audience with Raul Castro at the Vatican	75
4.3.10	Cuba and the U.S. Restore Full Diplomatic Ties	76
	CONCLUSION	77
	REFERENCES	84

ABBREVIATIONS

CST Catholic Social Teaching



INTRODUCTION

Under the realist vision of power that has traditionally prevailed amongst studies of international politics, scholars have tended to espouse a hard concept of power, which is oriented around the idea that nations use “material resources” to influence other nations.¹ For example, in *The Tragedy of Great Power Politics* Mearsheimer asserts that “power is based on the particular material capabilities that a state possesses”.² This is similar to the position Waltz takes in his *Theory of International Politics* where power is also defined in terms of capabilities which include “tangible assets” such as size of population and territory, economic capability and resource endowment.³ However, Waltz’s position is not purely limited to “tangible assets”. For example he also notes power as being derivative from competence, i.e. decision-making, leadership and policy, but ultimately asserts that these intangible measures are dependent on material capabilities to be effective.⁴ The above observations are merely provided to highlight the important role that material resources play under the traditional realist perspective. Bearing this in mind, consider the following:

Occupying a territory of merely 0.44 square kilometres, the Vatican is officially the smallest territory in the world that claims to be a state. It is unlike other modern nations in that it does not exist in order to support its citizens, but rather to serve as a base of administration for the Roman Catholic Church.⁵ Furthermore, with a population of under a thousand people,⁶ a non-commercial economy, and no military of its own (Italy provides Swiss Papal Guards to protect the city and the Pope),⁷ the political influence exerted by the Vatican is seemingly disproportionate to the sovereign jurisdiction which it holds over its own territory. So how is it

¹ Giulio Gallarotti, “Soft power: What it is, Why it’s Important, and the Conditions under which it Can Be Effectively Used”, **Division II Faculty Publications**, paper 57, 2011, p. 6.

² Gallarotti, p. 6.

³ Gallarotti, p. 7.

⁴ Gallarotti, p. 7.

⁵ Center for Productive Law and Policy, “Church or State: The Holy See at the United Nations”, <http://www.population-security.org/crlp-94-07.html>, (accessed on 01.11.2015).

⁶ Vatican City State, “Population”, <http://www.vaticanstate.va/content/vaticanstate/en/stato-e-governo/note-general/popolazione.html>, (accessed on 01.11.2015).

⁷ Center for Productive Law and Policy.

possible then that the Vatican, which possesses comparatively marginal material capabilities to other ‘influential’ states, is such a major player on the world stage?

On the 27 March 1968, Eugene Rostow, the then U.S. Under-Secretary of State for Political Affairs, addressed a conference on “the Vatican and Peace” at Boston College. The title of his speech was *The Role of the Vatican in the Modern World*, which was well received for its “very timely contributions to the discussions of the Vatican's contribution to World Peace through diplomacy”.⁸ Indeed although nearly half a century has passed since then, one may find that in terms of the above question his words still resonate today. Within his speech Rostow highlights the role of the Vatican as a focal point for a cultural and spiritual community and a “living system of ideas and values”, further attributing the influence of the Church in shaping the modern world to the “great ideas which it embodies, shapes and expresses- ideas which affect public opinion throughout the world”.⁹ To this end, the fact that the Vatican holds great meaning for one of the largest united masses of human beings on earth (nearly 1.2 billion Catholics worldwide¹⁰ which spread across the territories of practically all existing nations), has far reaching implications in terms of its potential ability to influence outcomes on a broad scale. An appreciation of the mentioned solicits this thesis’ pursuance of a research objective directed towards an improved understanding of the Vatican’s influence, which is undertaken through an investigation that directs its focus towards the three key areas of *Past*, *Provenance* and *Process*. Noting the important role that ideational elements play, this thesis’ approach remains within the framework of the liberal and constructivist worldviews. The historical background provided in *Past* consequently unearths some important ideas in Catholic Social Teaching (CST) which have developed over the course of the preceding century, subsequently forming a basis for an investigation into the sources of the Vatican’s influence which takes place under the *Provenance* chapter. Finally, by answering the research question of ‘How/In what way did the Vatican influence the recent thaw in U.S.-Cuban relations?’ progression is made

⁸ Eugene Rostow, “Speech on the Role of the Vatican in the Modern World”, **Global Catholic Network**, 27.03.1968, <https://www.ewtn.com/library/HUMANITY/VATMOD.HTM>Rostow, (accessed on 01.07.2015).

⁹ Rostow.

¹⁰ Cara.georgetown.edu, “Frequently Requested Church Statistics”, <http://cara.georgetown.edu/caraservices/requestedchurchstats.html>, (accessed on 03.08.2015).

towards a clearer understanding of the *Process* of the Vatican's influence during the fourth chapter, thereby completing the basis of arguments made in pursuit of achieving this thesis' primary objective.



CHAPTER 1

THEORETICAL FRAMEWORK AND METHODOLOGY

Before initiating an exploration of the theoretical framework, as a starting point it is necessary to distinguish between the terms “Vatican-City”, “Catholic Church”, and “Holy See”. This is because during the course of this thesis references are made to each, and although they are related, due observance should be given to each of their uniquely assigned characteristics. To this end, the working definition of these terms shall be aligned with Archbishop Jean-Louis Tauran’s observations which are as follows:

*In effect, it is important to make clear at once that the subject who enters into contact with the leading figures in international life is not the Catholic Church as a community of believers, nor the State of Vatican-City - a miniscule support-State that guarantees the spiritual freedom of the Pope with the minimum territory - but the Holy See, namely, the Pope and the Roman Curia, universal and spiritual authority, unique centre of communion; a sovereign subject of international law, of a religious and moral nature.*¹¹

Correspondingly, when this thesis refers to the “Vatican-City”, it may find an interest that is related to territorial qualities. However, it also recognizes that the Holy See “occupies the internationally recognized seat of sovereignty in the [State of] Vatican-City”.¹² Furthermore, in its use of the terms “Catholic Church”, and “Holy See”, notable consideration is given to the Pope who performs the dual function as the head of both, and is the “principal agent of papal diplomatic action”.¹³ Likewise, the Roman Curia forms not only part of the Holy See (as above), but is

¹¹ Jean Tauran, “Lecture by Archbishop Jean-Louis Tauran on the Theme of the Presence of the Holy-See in the International Organizations”, 22.04.2002, http://www.vatican.va/roman_curia/secretariat_state/documents/rc_seg-st_doc_20020422_tauran_en.html, (accessed on 19.07.2015).

¹² Alan Chong, “The Catholic Church in International Politics”, **E-International Relations**, 14.11.2013, <http://www.e-ir.info/2013/11/14/the-catholic-church-in-international-politics/>, (accessed on 01.08.2015).

¹³ Tauran.

also the central administration of the Church,¹⁴ where the Church's activities "touch almost every country and influence various aspects of human life".¹⁵ Finally, this thesis assigns collective qualities to the informal term "the Vatican". In this way it recognizes those empirical qualities analogous to the traditional sovereign-state (territory, population, effective rule over that territory and population, and recognition of other nation states),¹⁶ where the Holy See "occupies the internationally recognized seat of sovereignty within the Vatican-City State".¹⁷

1.1 LIBERALISM

As previously mentioned, in its pursuance of an improved understanding of Vatican's influence in world politics, this thesis adopts an eclectic approach that borrows from both the liberal and constructivist worldviews, the intention being to provide an alternative explanation that sufficiently addresses the pervasive role that ideational elements play. A contextual discussion which considers the liberal worldview or *grand theory*¹⁸ commences, followed by an investigation into such *midrange theories*¹⁹ as ideational liberalism and soft power.

It follows logically that comprehension of the Vatican's foreign policy would contribute to an improved understanding of its influence in world politics. Accordingly, liberalism's contributions to understanding foreign policy may be

¹⁴ Tauran.

- The Curia is the central administration of the Church, since, according to canon 360 the Pope "usually *conducts the business of the universal Church* by means of the Roman Curia" and it performs its function in his name and with his authority, for the benefit and service of the Churches.

¹⁵ Rostow.

¹⁶ Jay Roberts, "Sovereignty", **Towson**,

<http://www.towson.edu/polsci/irencyc/sovrein.htm>, (accessed on 01.11.2015).

¹⁷ Chong.

¹⁸ Laura Neack, **The New Foreign Policy: Power Seeking in a Globalized Era**, New York: Rowman and Littlefield Publishers, 2008, p. 12.

- "We can call realism, liberalism, and Marxism worldviews, traditions, or theories. At their most fundamental level, each offers what we call a grand theory of how the world of politics works. A grand theory purports to explain how things are the way they are—or, how things might be. In this latter sense, theories can be prescriptions for action to achieve the desired end point."

¹⁹ Neack, p. 13.

- The explanations of the world that result from these particularized studies are called midrange theories. These midrange theories don't claim to explain everything, just selected parts of world politics. In fact, midrange theories tend to do a better job of explaining parts of the world than the grand theories do in explaining all of the world

relevant particularly where it highlights how individuals and the ideals and ideas they exemplify, social forces, and political institutions, can directly affect foreign relations.²⁰ This contrasts the assumptions of structural realists, especially with regards to the latter's views concerning: [a] the determinative role of system structure (multipolar, bipolar, or unipolar), and [b] the assumption of state homogeneity (material, rational, and unitary actors).²¹ Therefore, by allowing for the "effects of varying ideas, interests and institutions", liberalism manages to produce predictions of foreign policy behaviour whilst incorporating modern conceptions of ethical foreign policy.²² To this end, consider Macmillan's assertion that;

..liberalism is better understood not as providing a blueprint for thinking about IR or foreign policy, but rather as a cluster or matrix of underlying values, principles, and purposes that provide a guide and framework through which one can think flexibly about IR, albeit within certain normative parameters..²³

The fact that liberalism "posits the need for building international institutions and norms in order to create a world civilization that will bring peace and prosperity to all"²⁴ holds great promise for potential insight into Vatican policy in general, where the Church similarly values and promotes certain ideas such as human dignity, solidarity, and the common good. In fact, the Church values these ideas as "fundamental presuppositions" which are expressed as "permanent principles" in the *Compendium of the Social Doctrine of the Church*.²⁵ Overall, Catholic Social Teaching (CST) emphasises the importance of moral values, which are "founded on the natural law" and "written on every human conscience" where "every human

²⁰ Michael Doyle, "Liberalism and Foreign Policy", **Foreign Policy, Theories, Actors and Cases**, (eds. Steve Smith, Amelia Hadfield and Tim Dunne), Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2008, p. 50.

²¹ Doyle, p. 50.

²² Doyle, p. 50.

²³ John Macmillan, "Liberal Internationalism", **International Relations Theory for the Twenty-First Century**, (ed. Martin Griffiths), New York: Routledge, 2007, p.21.

²⁴ Jonathan Fox and Shmuel Sandler, **Bringing Religion into International Relations**. New York: Palgrave-Macmillan, 2004, p. 169.

²⁵ Renato Martino "Press Conference for the Presentation of the Compendium of the Social Doctrine of the Church", 25.10.2004, http://www.vatican.va/roman_curia/pontifical_councils/justpeace/documents/rc_pc_justpeace_doc_20041025_compendio-dottrina-sociale_en.html, (accessed on 01.10.2015).

conscience is obliged to recognize and respect this law”.²⁶ Therefore after considering the importance of these Principles, which this thesis recognizes as moral pillars of the values expressed through Catholic culture and the Vatican’s policies, it is concluded that an overview of these Principles shall contribute towards its stated objectives. However, this shall be done under a separate heading in the third chapter, where the integrity of the Church’s teachings may be fully observed, as a misrepresentation of CST is indeed not the intention.

Furthermore, before continuing it should be elaborated that this thesis is neither naïve in its assessment of compatibility between the Church’s and liberal worldviews, nor does it attempt to equate the two in any way, shape or form. Accordingly it acknowledges that tensions do exist in numerous areas. For example, in the economic sphere, where the Church emphasises moral primacy and views regulation solely by the “law of the marketplace” as a failure of social justice.²⁷ Nonetheless, at its core it finds the liberal aspiration towards “harmony amongst international actors”²⁸ as complementary to the altruistic and hopeful nature of the Church’s perspective.

1.1.1 The Three Core Assumptions of Liberal Theories

Various strands of theory exist within the liberal school of thought. For Moravcsik “each type of liberal theory explains interstate politics by tracing the influence of variation in pressure from domestic and transnational societal actors on

²⁶ Pontifical Council for Justice and Peace (ed.), “Introduction”, **Compendium of the Social Doctrine of the Church**, 2004,

[http://www.vatican.va/roman_curia/pontifical_councils/justpeace/documents/rc_pc_justpeace_doc_20060526_compendio-dott-soc_en.html#The foundation of political authority](http://www.vatican.va/roman_curia/pontifical_councils/justpeace/documents/rc_pc_justpeace_doc_20060526_compendio-dott-soc_en.html#The%20foundation%20of%20political%20authority), (accessed on 01.10.2015).

²⁷ Catholic Church, **Catechism of the Catholic Church**, London: Geoffrey-Chapman, 1999, no. 2425.

- “The Church has rejected the totalitarian and atheistic ideologies associated in modern times with “communism” or “socialism.” She has likewise refused to accept, in the practice of “capitalism,” individualism and the absolute primacy of the law of the marketplace over human labor.²⁰⁷ Regulating the economy solely by centralized planning perverts the basis of social bonds; regulating it solely by the law of the marketplace fails social justice, for “there are many human needs which cannot be satisfied by the market.”²⁰⁸ Reasonable regulation of the marketplace and economic initiatives, in keeping with a just hierarchy of values and a view to the common good, is to be commended.”

²⁸ Neack, p. 16.

underlying state preferences”.²⁹ However, there are three hard core assumptions that all liberal theories share. This thesis now moves to contextualise these core assumptions in terms of its approach.

The first assumption relates to the nature of the actors in international politics where the liberal assumption rests on a bottom-up view of politics. “Individuals and private groups, who organize and exchange to promote their interests” are seen as the fundamental actors in international politics. In terms of the interests which underlie state behaviour, the demands of these societal groups and individuals are treated as “exogenous causes”. The common intuition therefore, is that the exercise of interstate power or the promotion of interstate collective action cannot be understood without first understanding the fundamental social purposes that each state seeks.³⁰ Congruent with this thesis’ approach then, consideration of the ideas enshrined within CST shall also help us to better understand the “fundamental social purposes” which the Vatican seeks.

The second assumption of liberal theory relates to the nature of the state. Under this assumption states and political institutions represent subsets of domestic society. The weighted preferences of those subsets constitute the goals or “state preferences” that are pursued by rational state officials through foreign policy.³¹ Under this liberal conception the state is a representative institution.³² Here, MacMillan notes that one can appreciate why liberals advocate “liberal democratic” political systems (e.g. republics and constitutional monarchies), which are regarded as offering the means for facilitating the “greatest collective domain of freedom for equal individuals”, because they are bound by such principles as “accountability of power, political representation through an independent legislature and the rule of law, and the enjoyment of human rights”.³³ He also highlights the traditional liberal emphasis on “education, individual and collective responsibility for action, and the notion of enlightened self-interest as the best hope for individual and collective

²⁹ Andrew Moravcsik, “Liberal International Relations Theory: A Scientific assessment”, **Progress in International Relations Theory: Appraising the Field**, (eds. Colin Elman and Miriam Elman), Massachussets: MIT Press, 2003, p.169.

³⁰ Moravcsik, p. 162.

³¹ Moravcsik, p. 163.

³² Moravcsik, p. 163.

³³ MacMillan, p. 22.

progress”.³⁴ Similarly, under its third chapter this thesis will discuss how the Church’s teachings and traditional stance support “authentic” democracy, which also “requires that the necessary conditions be present for the advancement both of the individual through education and formation in true ideals, and of the ‘subjectivity’ of society through the creation of structures of participation and shared responsibility”.³⁵

The third assumption of liberal theory is that behaviour in the international system is shaped by the configuration of state preferences.³⁶ Here, states seek to realize their own distinct preferences under the constraints imposed by other states’ preferences.³⁷ Furthermore, the concept of policy interdependence provides the link between varying state preferences and varying policy behaviour, thereby setting aside the realist assumption which treats state preferences as naturally conflictual.³⁸ This pattern of interdependence that exists among state preferences is seen to ultimately impose a binding constraint on state behaviour.³⁹ Of particular importance here is the Church’s perspective on interdependence under which it has long supported the development of multilateral institutions.⁴⁰ Here its emphasis on [1] respect for the equality of members of the international community, [2] collective responsibility for the common destiny, and [3] activities which are directed to the service of human dignity,⁴¹ results in a view that recognizes and converges on the potential benefits of interstate collaboration. To this end, the social teachings of Pope John XXIII and the Second Vatican Council again highlight the importance and

³⁴ MacMillan, p. 22.

³⁵ Diarmuid Martin, “Comment on Hittinger’s ‘The Coherence of the Four Basic Principles of Catholic Social Doctrine- an Interpretation’”. **Pursuing the Common Good: How Solidarity and Subsidiarity Can work Together**, The Proceedings of the 14th Plenary Session of the Pontifical Academy of Social Sciences. Vatican City. 2-6.05.2008, p. 125.

³⁶ Moravcsik, p. 164.

³⁷ Moravcsik, p. 165.

³⁸ Moravcsik, p. 164.

³⁹ Moravcsik, p. 165.

⁴⁰ Silvano Tomasi, “The Representation of the Catholic Church at the United Nations in Geneva”, **International Catholic Organizations and Catholic Inspired NGO’s: Their Contribution to the Building of the International Community**, Chambesy: MathiasNebel, 2012, p.12.

- E.g, as far back as 1931, Pius XI was already calling for international cooperation in order to “prevent the damaging consequences of wild capitalism and nationalism”.

⁴¹ Tomasi, p. 12.

primacy of the ethical dimension which is “based upon the moral law written in the heart of every man and woman”.⁴²

For Moravcsik, the above mentioned “hard-core” assumptions are relatively content free, and although these core assumptions are useful in defining the liberal paradigm, some additional propositions assist further by helping us to identify specific strands.⁴³ He therefore introduces some variants of liberal theory amongst which, particular to this thesis’ interest, ideational liberalism is included.

1.1.2 Ideational Liberalism

Ideational liberalism, sees the “configuration of domestic social identities and values as a basic determinant of state preferences and thus of interstate conflict and cooperation”.⁴⁴ Under this strand, predictions concerning international politics flow from three ideational liberal sources of societal preferences:⁴⁵ [1] *national identity*, which stresses that mutual recognition and coexistence is more likely where borders and underlying patterns of identity coincide; [2] *political identity*, where groups and individuals are committed to specific political institutions resulting in conflict being more likely “where the realization of legitimate domestic political order in one jurisdiction threatens its realization in others”;⁴⁶ and [3] *socioeconomic identity*, where “domestic and international markets are embedded in local social compromises concerning the provision of regulatory public goods”.⁴⁷ Ultimately, although this thesis acknowledges the usefulness of ideational liberalism’s explanations (and accordingly references these explanations), it finds Nye’s soft power explanations to be more suited to its approach. Especially because of the latter’s emphasis on the relationship between leadership and attraction,⁴⁸ the

⁴² Tomasi, p. 12.

⁴³ Moravcsik, p. 159.

- In particular, Moravcsik identifies the strands of “ideational, republican, and commercial” liberalism.

⁴⁴ Moravcsik, p. 168.

⁴⁵ Moravcsik, p. 169.

⁴⁶ Moravcsik, p. 170.

⁴⁷ Moravcsik, p. 171.

⁴⁸ Joseph Nye, **Soft Power: The Means to Success in World Politics**, (e-book), New York: PublicAffairs Publishers, 2004, (Soft Power), pp. 18-19.

individual role that the Pope plays is found to be of particular importance in an overall understanding of the Vatican's influence in world politics.

1.1.3 Soft Power

In his 1990 article *Soft Power*, Nye draws attention to the power of ideas noting that “the realist who focuses only on the balance of hard power will miss the power of transnational ideas”.⁴⁹ In the context of this thesis this assertion bears even greater weight when considering the role that the Vatican plays as a focal point for a cultural and spiritual community of nearly 1.2 billion Catholics worldwide.⁵⁰ Nye observes that in a world of growing interdependence, factors such as technology, education and economic growth are becoming increasingly important in international power,⁵¹ and that in terms of national security, new dimensions such as economic and ecological threats also need to be considered. His argument that “the changing nature of international politics has also made intangible forms of power more important”⁵² ultimately leads to his elaboration on the concept of soft power where, over the years, he has refined and developed his theory. Numerous scholars have subsequently contributed to this ever-growing body of soft power literature.

For Nye, hard power may rest on inducements or threats (the carrot or stick approach). Soft power, on the other hand, “rests on the ability to shape the preferences of others”.⁵³ It is the ability to get “others to want the same outcomes that you want” and “achieve goals through attraction rather than coercion”⁵⁴ where a change in behaviour is possible without competition or conflict by using attraction and persuasion. Given the fact that soft power does not require substantial tangible

-
- “Leadership is not just a matter of issuing commands, but also involves leading by example and attracting others to do what you want”
 - “Political leaders have long understood the power that comes from attraction...politicians in democracies have to rely more on a combination of inducement and attraction”
 - “The ability to establish preferences tends to be associated with intangible assets such as an attractive personality...If a leader represents values that others want to follow, it will cost less to lead”

⁴⁹ Joseph Nye, “Soft Power”, *Foreign Policy*, no. 80, 1990, (SP), p.170.

⁵⁰ Cara.georgetown.edu.

⁵¹ Nye, SP, p. 154.

⁵² Nye, SP, p. 164.

⁵³ Nye, *Soft Power*, p. 18.

⁵⁴ Nye, *Soft Power*, p. 18.

resources, (its currency, according to Nye, is culture, political values, and foreign policies),⁵⁵ it holds great promise for explanations of the Vatican's role and influence in world politics. Like the Church's utopian worldview, emphasis is not on the looming possibility of war, but on the possibility of cooperation, where the power of ideas takes precedence. This thesis therefore finds soft power theory particularly useful in its approach. Consequently, elaborations on soft power theory and how soft power is deployed are referenced heavily throughout, thereby rendering the induction of any detailed explanations under the current heading as an unnecessary duplication of efforts.

To conclude this heading, it would be prudent to address the rationale behind this study's location of soft power theory under the liberal perspective. Accordingly it may be observed that many of Nye's assertions adopt aspects of liberal theory or, more particularly, neoliberal institutionalism.⁵⁶ For example:

*...if a country can shape international rules that are consistent with its interests and values, its actions will more likely appear legitimate in the eyes of others...*⁵⁷

Similarly, Gallarotti's interpretations of soft power identify some principles of political liberalism in both its international and domestic sources (further discussed under Chapter Three):

*Both domestic and international sources of soft power reflect an emphasis on policies and actions that exude an orientation of justice, collective concern, and rules of fair play. In this respect we clearly see pervasive principles of political liberalism at work in both sources.*⁵⁸

Finally, in terms of absolute versus relative gains, Nye asserts that "soft power need not be a zero-sum game in which one country's gain is necessary another

⁵⁵ Nye, *Soft Power*, p. 20.

⁵⁶ Maxime Gomichon, "Joseph Nye on Soft Power", *E-International Relations*, 8.03.2013, <http://www.e-ir.info/2013/03/08/joseph-nye-on-soft-power/>, (accessed on 01.08.2015).

⁵⁷ Nye, *Soft Power*, p. 22.

⁵⁸ Gallarotti, p. 22.

country's loss.⁵⁹ His perspective therefore, is that soft power may benefit 'both sides', which is closer to the liberal view that states sometimes seek prosperity and further from the realist assumption that states seek only security.⁶⁰

1.2 CONSTRUCTIVISM

Under the constructivist worldview, the world is seen as being 'socially constructed'.⁶¹ To clarify, the term 'socially' means that they give greater weight to the social as opposed to material aspects in world politics, whilst the term 'constructed' means that they see the world as coming into being through a process that includes interaction between agents (states/individuals/non-state actors) and the structures of their broader environment.⁶² Constructivism would tell us that: if states choose a value system that is power-oriented and behave anarchically, then the system would resemble the system posited by realists. Alternatively it would posit that: if states cooperate, then the system would resemble the liberal perception.⁶³ It is particularly useful in this thesis' approach because it recognizes that in an increasingly globalized world, the boundaries which separate domestic and international are becoming more blurred,⁶⁴ thereby allowing for a cross-level approach which considers states, individuals, and non-state actors. In the context of this study, this helps to overcome the level of analysis problem where, for example, the Pope (individual) plays an important role, both as head of the Holy See (state) and the Church (non-state). Furthermore, constructivism also helps us to better understand Vatican's role in the international system by highlighting the importance of the process in which ideas influence international institutions and consequently, the way that states behave.

Reus-Smit asserts that through empirical research, constructivists have managed to "expose the explanatory poverty of materialist scepticism", and have

⁵⁹ Gomichon.

⁶⁰ Gomichon.

⁶¹ Jeffrey Checkel, "Constructivism and Foreign Policy", **Foreign Policy, Theories, Actors and Cases**, (eds. Steve Smith, Amelia Hadfield and Tim Dunne), Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2008, p.73.

⁶² Checkel, p. 72.

⁶³ Fox and Sandler, p. 170.

⁶⁴ Checkel, p.77.

shown how ideas and values shape political action in ways that contradict the expectations of rationalist and materialist theories.⁶⁵ If, as it does, this thesis finds the role that ideas play in world politics important, then after considering the following the benefits of incorporating constructivism in its approach should become further apparent. We now turn to some observations concerning constructivism's three core ontological propositions about social life, which constructivists claim illuminate more about world politics than other rival rationalist assumptions.⁶⁶

1.2.1 Constructivism's 3 Core Ontological Propositions about Social Life

Firstly, with regards to structures shaping the behaviour of social and political actors (be they individuals or states), constructivists posit that ideational and normative structures are just as important as material structures.⁶⁷ Whilst Marxists emphasise the material structure of the capitalist world economy and neo-realists stress the material structure of the balance of military power, constructivists believe that systems of shared ideas, values and beliefs also have structural characteristics and exert powerful influence on political and social action.⁶⁸ Constructivists attach importance to ideational and normative structures for two reasons: [1] "material resources only acquire meaning for human action through the structure of shared knowledge in which they are embedded";⁶⁹ and [2] ideational and normative structures are thought to shape the social identities of political actors.⁷⁰

Secondly, for constructivists it is important to understand how non-material structures condition actors' identities because identities inform interests, and consequently, actions.⁷¹ Therefore in order to explain interest formation, they focus

⁶⁵ Christian Reus-Smit, "Constructivism", **Theories of International Relations**, (eds. Scott Burchill, Andrew Linklater, Richard Devetak, Jack Donnelly, Matthew Paterson, Christian Reus-Smit and Jacqui True), New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2005, p.217.

⁶⁶ Reus-Smit, p. 196.

⁶⁷ Reus-Smit, p. 196.

⁶⁸ Reus-Smit, p. 196.

⁶⁹ Alexander Wendt, "Constructing International Politics", **International Security**, vol. 20, no. 1, 2005, (Constructing), p.73.

⁷⁰ Reus-Smit, p. 196.

⁷¹ Reus-Smit, p. 197.

on the social identities of states or individuals, where according to Wendt, “identities are the basis of interests”.⁷²

Thirdly, with regards to this heading’s earlier discussion regarding their view of the world as ‘socially constructed’, constructivists contend that agents and structures are mutually constituted. The overarching argument here is that “normative and ideational structures may well condition the identities and interests of actors, but those structures would not exist if it were not for the knowledgeable practices of those actors.”⁷³ Here, in accordance with Wendt’s arguments concerning intersubjective knowledge, “it is through reciprocal interaction... that we create and instantiate the relatively enduring social structures in terms of which we define our identities and interests”.⁷⁴

Ultimately then, after consideration of the above, this thesis finds the constructivist argument for the importance of norms and ideas to be widely compatible with its approach. However, the benefits of incorporating constructivism are not exclusively limited to its arguments, as there are some practical advantages too. This is because it proffers a variety of methods which provide researchers with the practical ‘tools’ needed to answer their research questions. A discussion of that is included during the shortly upcoming discussion of the primary case study, which takes place in Chapter Four.

1.3 METHOD AND CONTENT

The framework of this thesis’ main body is structured in accordance with its earlier stated objective, which focusses specifically on the three key areas of *Past*, *Provenance* and *Process*. Hence, a chapter has been allocated to each of the mentioned, as per discussions under the forthcoming headings:

⁷² Alexander Wendt, “Anarchy is what States Make of it: The Social Construction of Power Politics”, **International Organization**, vol. 46, no. 2, 1992, (Anarchy), p.398.

⁷³ Reus-Smit, p. 197.

⁷⁴ Wendt, Anarchy, p. 406.

1.3.1 Past: A Historical Background

In pursuit of providing a contextual background that fulfils the criteria of contributing towards the primary objective, the main body begins with a *descriptive* historical account which aims to highlight the significant role that Vatican has played in world politics over the course of the last century. Within the context of the already-established importance of an emphasis on ideas, it is worth noting the constructivist perspective regarding history, under which Reus-Smit asserts that:

*...if ideas, norms, and practices matter, and if they differ from one social context to another, then history in turn matters...*⁷⁵

After consideration of the above, this thesis subsequently finds it suitable to link its historical background under the *Past* chapter with an investigation into the development of important ideas which have emerged in Catholic social thought and teaching. Some of these ideas subsequently expanded upon under the following chapter. In terms of structure, headings under *Past* are divided sequentially in accordance with the pontificates of the Popes serving from the beginning of the 20th century (the birth of the State of Vatican-City), since papal writings play an important role in the development of Catholic social thought.

1.3.2 Provenance: Sources of the Vatican's Influence

Once a historical overview has been provided, the dissertation continues towards its primary objective by considering the sources of the Vatican's influence. As a starting point, it distinguishes the Vatican's particular form of influence as soft power, where outcomes are produced through "argumentative spiritual persuasion and co-option through ideas".⁷⁶ Here particularly, "the deployment of Faith and Hope as values in international interactions and global society" also plays an essential role.⁷⁷ According to Nye, soft power itself is more than just the ability to move

⁷⁵ Reus-Smit, p. 207.

⁷⁶ Chong.

⁷⁷ Chong.

people by argument or to persuade others, it is also the ability to produce attraction, and this often leads to “acquiescence”.⁷⁸ He views soft power as essential to obtaining peace, (one of the objectives to which the Vatican’s actions in the international arena are fundamentally directed) and asserts that the “attraction” of other foreign populations, as well as nations’ assistance in the construction of capable democratic states both play vital roles in its achievement.⁷⁹ In behavioural terms, soft power is attractive power, and the assets that produce such attraction are known as soft-power resources.⁸⁰

The reflections above consequently lead to ruminations concerning how the Vatican produces this attraction in order to influence world politics in pursuit of its preferences, and subsequently, to the question of “**Where does the Vatican’s soft-power stem from?**” Hitherto this dissertation argues that an analysis which examines the soft power resources presently posited under ‘soft theory’ literature, whilst directing its contextual focus towards the Vatican, shall sufficiently address the above question, thereby further contributing towards an understanding of Vatican’s influence in world politics. In doing so, an eclectic approach extends throughout the chapter’s investigations, which combine conventional qualitative and interpretative elements, but also makes use of quantitative data to support its arguments. The use of this data may be observed particularly where it is incorporated into the soft power approach, where Nye purports that such means as opinion polls and focus groups are often useful instruments in the measurement of soft power or ‘attractiveness’.⁸¹

Nye’s ideas concerning co-optation further posit that influence may be acquired if an actor is able to mould the interests and preferences of other actors so that they converge closer to its own interests.⁸² In other words, countries are able to obtain the outcomes that they want in politics because other countries admire them, aspire to them and wish to emulate their example.⁸³ Under the current soft theory

⁷⁸ Nye, *Soft Power*, p. 19.

⁷⁹ Matteo Pallaver, **Power and its forms: Hard, Soft, Smart** (MPhil Dissertation), London School of Economics, London, 2011, p. 87.

⁸⁰ Nye, *Soft Power*, p. 19.

⁸¹ Joseph Nye, “Think Again: Soft Power”, **Foreign Policy**, 23.02.2006, <http://foreignpolicy.com/2006/02/23/thing-again-soft-power/>, (accessed on 09.10.2015).

⁸² Gallarotti, p. 14.

⁸³ Nye, *Soft Power*, p. 18.

literature, scholars have provided varying categorizations of the sources of soft-power. However, their perspectives are commonly aligned with Nye's views that in international politics the resources that produce soft power stem largely from culture, political values, and foreign policies or "the values an organization or country expresses in its culture, the examples it sets by internal practices and policies, and its relations with others."⁸⁴ The interrelated role which domestic factors and international variables play in influencing a country's ability to determine the preferences of others is also generally acknowledged amongst proponents of soft theory. For example, Gallarotti asserts that "both domestic and international sources of soft power reflect an emphasis on policies and actions that exude an orientation of justice, collective concern, and rules of fair play" where we clearly find "pervasive principles of political liberalism at work in both sources."⁸⁵ The framework of the *Provenance* chapter therefore utilizes, in part, a combination of Nye's and Gallarotti's categorizations, and where possible, directs its focus towards illustrations that hold contemporary relevance. This is important because, as Nye posits, "soft power is not static".⁸⁶

Prior to commencing its examination of the Vatican's soft power resources, the *Provenance* chapter opens with a brief descriptive overview of the Principles of Catholic Social Teaching. In doing so, this undertaking expands upon some of the ideas mentioned under the *Past* chapter's historical background. The following discussion elaborates on the rationale behind the incorporation of these principles under the heading of *Provenance*.

In his speech highlighting the role of the Vatican in the modern world, Rostow asserts that although the Vatican has a skilled international bureaucracy with multiple resources, above all it derives its influence from the ideas and values that it shapes, embodies, and expresses, which in turn affect public opinion throughout the world.⁸⁷ With a global Catholic population of over 1.2 billion, nearly 220, 000

⁸⁴ Nye, *Soft Power*, p. 20.

⁸⁵ Gallarotti, p. 22.

⁸⁶ Nye, *Soft Power*, p. 71.

⁸⁷ Rostow.

- This paper acknowledges that the source is dated, however due to "it's very timely contributions to the discussions of the Vatican's contribution to world peace" it still maintains its contextual relevance.

parishes spread across the world (2014),⁸⁸ and a multitude of Church universities, monasteries, schools and convents; one of the ways in which these ideas and values are transmitted to groups and individuals in domestic societies worldwide is through Catholic Social Teaching (CST), which is viewed as part of the Church's evangelizing mission. In this vein, theories such as ideational liberalism that adopt a bottom-up approach are useful as they highlight the importance of societal groups and individuals as exogenous causes of the interests underlying state behaviour.⁸⁹ This is further reflected in Moravcsik's assertion that representative institutions constitute a "transmission belt" by which the social power and preferences of groups and individuals in civil society, enter the political realm and are translated into state policy.⁹⁰ Relevant then, to this dissertation's attention to ideas and values, is Pope Leo's encyclical *Rerum Novarum* (1891) which is widely regarded as the cornerstone of CST, where Leo laid out his views on some basic guiding principles and Christian values that "should influence the way societies and countries operate".⁹¹ Particularly over the last hundred years, Catholic theologians have continued to examine issues of daily life and society in order to propose and set forth some fundamental principles:

*...If one reads *Mystici Corporis* (1943), Pius XII's encyclical on the nature of the Church, alongside the three great 'social' encyclicals – *Rerum Novarum* (1891), *Quadragesimo Anno* (1931), and *Centesimus Annus* (1991) – it is apparent that the ensemble of teachings share a common stock of principles on such things as the human person, the different forms of solidarity, subsidiarity, and the common good....*⁹²

With regards to the unique approach that the *Provenance* chapter employs, the significance of the mentioned principles becomes apparent when we consider that

⁸⁸ Cara.georgetown.edu.

- These figures in accordance with CARA 2014 recordings where the total number is indicated as 221 740

⁸⁹ Moravcsik, p. 161.

⁹⁰ Moravcsik, p. 163.

⁹¹ Catholic.org.nz, "Principles of Catholic Social Teaching", <http://www.catholic.org.nz/social-action/dsp-default.cfm?loadref=62>, (accessed on 01.07.2015).

⁹² Russel Hittinger, "The Coherence of the Four Basic Principles of Catholic Social Doctrine- An Interpretation", **Pursuing the Common Good: How Solidarity and Subsidiarity Can work Together**, The Proceedings of the 14th Plenary Session of the Pontifical Academy of Social Sciences, Vatican City, 2-6.05.2008, p.76.

[1] this thesis recognizes these principles as moral pillars of the values expressed through Catholic culture and the Vatican's policies,⁹³ and [2] a country may obtain the outcomes it wants in world politics because other countries-admiring its values, emulating its example"...wants to follow it."⁹⁴ Therefore, it argues that an observation of these principles would not only be useful in helping to understand why the Vatican holds the particular political values that it does, but it would also contribute towards an overall understanding of the stimulation and creation of relations of attraction towards the Vatican which have direct bearing on its capacity to achieve its preferred outcomes in world politics.

This however, though seemingly simple, is no easy task in itself because [1] a detailed examination of these principles requires theological, philosophical and social-scientific considerations, where an observance of all these elements has the potential to expand the scope of this study beyond its current objectives, and [2] the Church's teachings are often distorted when observed through political ideologies and discourse which is *absolutely not* this thesis' intention. Paradoxically then, the above challenges sit in tension with the benefit of contextual understanding derived from an examination of these principles. Therefore, in pursuit of middle ground which would preserve the integrity of the Church's teachings regarding these principles, whilst still advancing their basic contextual value, this dissertation [A] conducts a mere descriptive overview of the principles, prior to the commencement of the chapter's main study, which emphasises that the implications of these principles extend far beyond the abbreviated, contextually relevant explanation which has been provided, and [B] respects and recognizes that these principles should be read in their unison and in terms of their 'connectedness', because:

....one pope introduces new themes while circling back upon the work of his predecessors. It is the Roman way to introduce new considerations while at the same time tightening their connection to the preceding tradition. Old things are made to look new, and new things look old. John Paul II referred to the scribe trained for the kingdom, who is compared to 'a householder who brings out of

⁹³ Martino.

- As previously discussed, the Church values them as "fundamental presuppositions" which are expressed as "permanent principles".

⁹⁴ Nye, *Soft Power*, p.18.

*his treasure what is new and what is old' (Mt. 13:52). This is not mere pious sentimentality. The Pope meant it as a hermeneutical principle suitable for reading the tradition of social doctrine...*⁹⁵

1.3.3 Process: A Case Study of the Vatican's Role in the U.S.-Cuban Thaw

In order to progress towards an understanding of the process of the Vatican's influence, this dissertation's *Process* chapter conducts a case study which demonstrates the exercise of Vatican's influence in a present-day context. Hence, its attention turns towards the still-ongoing U.S.-Cuban rapprochement process where a surprise announcement was made on 17 December 2014 that, following months of secret negotiations, the U.S. and Cuba would seek to normalise relations between their two nations.⁹⁶ In this particular case Pope Francis, by following up on the work of his predecessors (Pope John Paul and Pope Benedict had previously undertaken historic visits to Cuba and held meetings with Fidel Castro in 1998 and 2012 respectively),⁹⁷ is known to have played a pivotal role in the diplomatic thaw between the two formerly estranged nations. Accordingly, both Barack Obama and Raul Castro have thanked Francis for his role in brokering the historic deal that began normalizing relations between the two countries, thereby bringing an end to decades of Cold War hostility.⁹⁸ Taking the above into consideration, the research question asked in this case is **'How/In what way did the Vatican influence the recent thaw in U.S.-Cuban relations?'** Through a series of various positions, the *Process* chapter will argue that the relations of admiration and respect generated from the Vatican's positive image placed it in a favourable position to effectively initiate a series of conciliatory moves which encouraged dialogue and supported progression on the (interrelated) economic, humanitarian, ideological and diplomatic

⁹⁵ Hittinger, p. 77.

⁹⁶ Dan Roberts, "Obama and Raúl Castro Thank Pope for Breakthrough in US-Cuba Relations", **The Guardian**, 17.12.2014, <http://www.theguardian.com/world/2014/dec/17/us-cuba-diplomatic-relations-obama-raul-castro>, (accessed on 01.09.2015).

⁹⁷ David Willey, "Popular Pope Francis Takes Own Path in Vatican", **BBC News**, 24.12.2014, <http://www.bbc.com/news/world-europe-30528913>, (accessed on 16.10.2015).

⁹⁸ Roberts.

barriers that had previously dominated U.S.-Cuban relations, thereby contributing towards a thaw in relations between the two nations.

In its pursuit of addressing the above question, the *Process* chapter's pluralistic approach borrows from both conventional constructivism and European constructivism, consequently utilizing the methods of both content analysis, and process tracing.

Content analysis is a method that is useful to the European (interpretive) constructivist approach due to the latter's utilization of "various forms of textual analysis"⁹⁹ in its exploration of "the role of language in mediating and constructing social reality".¹⁰⁰ The method itself involves making inferences from text¹⁰¹ and is particularly useful where research questions (such as the afore-stated) involve extracting meanings from communications.¹⁰² Therefore, anything which is intended to communicate a message is usable as material under this method.¹⁰³ In this case, an official communique from the Vatican Secretariat of State on the re-establishment of Cuban-U.S. diplomatic relations is examined. It is particularly useful as contained within the communique are references to Vatican's involvement in the rapprochement process.¹⁰⁴ An examination of the latter provides an opportunity to explore the prevalent social and background conditions, and deepen our contextual understanding of the event in question. This results in a subsequent unearthing of constitutive elements, and an improved understanding of the chain of events which takes place under the process tracing which follows.

Process tracing on the other hand, is a method that is useful for the study of causal processes (causal chains or mechanisms which connect the independent and dependent variables),¹⁰⁵ which explains why it is such an invaluable tool for

⁹⁹ Checkel, p. 79.

- "... [research] tools include... discourse or other forms of textual analysis (for the European type)."

¹⁰⁰ Checkel, p. 73.

¹⁰¹ Margaret Hermann, "Content Analysis", **Qualitative Methods in International Relations: A Pluralist Guide**, (eds. Audie Klotz and Deepa Prakesh), New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2008, p. 151.

¹⁰² Hermann, p. 152.

¹⁰³ Hermann, p. 152.

¹⁰⁴ News.va, "Pope Welcomes U.S. and Cuban Moves to Normalise Relations", 17.12.2014, <http://www.news.va/en/news/pope-welcomes-us-and-cuban-moves-to-normalise-rela>, (accessed on 03.09.2015).

¹⁰⁵ Amir Lupovici, "Constructivist methods: A Plea and Manifesto for Pluralism", **Review of International Studies**, vol.35, 2009, p. 202.

conventional (positivist) constructivists, whose interests lie with the causal relationships between actors, interests, norms, and identities.¹⁰⁶ It is used to identify complex relations between variables, focal points, agent-structure relations, and the influence of expectations, thereby providing a way to study ideational factors, the evolution of social phenomena, as well as the influence of these phenomena on actors' behaviour.¹⁰⁷ Although process tracing is useful for illustrating the evolution of social practices and developments,¹⁰⁸ this thesis' perspective (as discussed above) is that there is additional benefit to be gained by combining process it with another interpretive method in order to unearth the constitutive dimensions, which is why this thesis has opted for its pluralistic approach.

Overall this dissertation views an investigation of this nature as holding potential for a positive contribution to this field of study because, as Checkel notes "power is central to the study of international relations and foreign policy. However, constructivists have been curiously silent on its role".¹⁰⁹ Furthermore, an advantage of incorporating the constructivist approach in this case is that, because of constructivism's recognition that 'the boundaries separating the international and domestic have become increasingly fuzzier in an increasingly globalized world', it becomes easier to overcome the level of analysis problem that may often presents itself.¹¹⁰ Hitherto, it is also worth noting that although this case study addresses the Vatican bureaucracy as a whole, the role of individual agents is likewise emphasised. In this context Tauran's assertion holds further pertinence:

I would like to begin with an observation that is frequently overlooked. The principal agent of papal diplomatic action is the Pope himself. With his pastoral ministry, his words, his travels, his meetings - that involve the earth's peoples and those who govern them - he can inspire political leaders, give an orientation to a great many social initiatives and, at times, contest systems or ideas that corrode the dignity of the person and thus threaten world peace.¹¹¹

¹⁰⁶ Checkel, p. 72

¹⁰⁷ Lupovici, p. 202.

¹⁰⁸ Lupovici, p. 202.

¹⁰⁹ Checkel, p. 80.

¹¹⁰ Checkel, p. 77.

¹¹¹ Tauran.

Finally, it should be noted that before the *Process* chapter commences with its analysis and investigations, a brief descriptive historical overview of U.S. - Cuban relations following Fidel Castro's ascension to power is provided to serve as a contextual background. Pertinent elements of the Vatican's relations with U.S. and Cuba have rather been included in the chapter's main body. This is done in an effort to mitigate any unnecessary repetition and allow for a more succinct explanation of arguments where the Vatican is concerned, since the Vatican holds this dissertation's primary focus.



CHAPTER 2: *PAST*

A HISTORICAL BACKGROUND

The “Roman Question” arose during 1870 as a result of the Piedmontese Governments’ suppression of the popes’ temporal sovereignty over the Papal States.¹¹² In protest of this suppression, the popes declared themselves prisoners of the Vatican and refused to acknowledge the Italian Government’s legitimacy.¹¹³ Due to its limited power the papacy had to rely on its spiritual or teaching authority, and in 1870 the first Vatican Council defined the absolute primacy of the pope (Pius IX at that stage) on “matters of faith and morals”.¹¹⁴

Against the backdrop of the industrial revolution which caused new issues in European society such as growing poverty amongst workers and the increasing popularity of socialist movements, Pope Leo XIII (1878-1903) released the encyclical *Rerum Novarum*- “of New Things” (1891), which highlighted some principles that were necessary to establish a just society.¹¹⁵ The encyclical is widely regarded as the core of all later CST. On the one hand, it expressed moral contention to wealth disparities between the fortunes of the few and poverty of the masses, and on the other hand, it upheld the right to private property and rejected the Marxist “class-struggle”.¹¹⁶ In *Rerum Novarum*, Leo also laid down the principle of Labour over Capital, where people are more important than property, thereby highlighting his concern for the dignity and value of the human person and the poor in particular.¹¹⁷ His identification of the state’s role in promoting “both public well-being and private prosperity” formed the foundations for what later became known as the Common Good.¹¹⁸ Historically, the importance of *Rerum Novarum* was signalled by the Pope’s “new” willingness to engage with the changes happening in contemporary society.¹¹⁹

¹¹² Francis Murphy, “Vatican Politics: Structure and Function”, **World Politics**, vol. 26, 1974, p. 543,

¹¹³ Murphy, p. 543.

¹¹⁴ Encyclopaedia Britannica, “The Modern Papacy”, (Papacy), <http://global.britannica.com/topic/papacy/The-modern-papacy>, (accessed on 08.07.2015).

¹¹⁵ Rob Esdaille, “2000 Years of Catholic Ethics”, **Catholic Social Teaching**, <http://www.catholicsocialteaching.org.uk/principles/history/>, (accessed on 08.07.2015).

¹¹⁶ Esdaille.

¹¹⁷ Esdaille.

¹¹⁸ Esdaille.

¹¹⁹ Esdaille.

2.1 POPE PIUS XI (1922-1939)

It was only in 1929 that the Lateran Treaty formally spelled out “the concept of the sovereignty of the Holy See”,¹²⁰ thereby bringing an end to the Roman Question. Under the Treaty, the “sovereignty of the pope as supreme pastor of the Holy See as well as his independence as ruler of the Vatican-City State” was recognized,¹²¹ and further reinforced by the Holy See’s declaration of intent to “remain outside of any territorial competition,” thereby characterizing itself as a neutral state.¹²²

The conclusion of the Lateran Treaty also coincided with the aftermath of World War 1. At that time the West was also experiencing the “Great Depression”, Germany was in economic crisis, and Russia had justified the deaths of many of its own people as “necessary for the good of the state”.¹²³ Shortly after having signed the treaty, Pope Pius XI declared himself “ready to confront the devil if it were necessary for the good of the Church or the salvation of souls”.¹²⁴ In his efforts to maintain and establish the Catholic Church, he subsequently concluded a record number of concordats, which included agreements with Mussolini’s fascist government to secure recognition for the Holy See’s international independence, and the *Reichskonkordat* with Hitler’s Nazi regime to protect the rights of Catholics in the Third Reich.¹²⁵ Pius XI furthermore found a concern with the “damaging consequences of wild capitalism and nationalism”, and desired a “regulation of procedures of the world economy”.¹²⁶ Consequently, in 1931 he began calls for international cooperation. Some of his ideas were set forth in the encyclical *Quadragesimo Anno* (1931) in which he criticized the fact that “immense power and despotic economic domination” lay in the hands of a few.¹²⁷ *Quadragesimo Anno* also condemned dictatorship and exposed the dangers of fascism and communism,

¹²⁰ Murphy, p. 543.

¹²¹ Murphy, p. 543.

¹²² Murphy, p. 544.

¹²³ Esdaille.

¹²⁴ Murphy, p. 550.

¹²⁵ Murphy, p. 550.

¹²⁶ Tomasi.

¹²⁷ Pius XI, “*Quadragesimo Anno*”, 1931,

http://w2.vatican.va/content/piusxi/en/encyclicals/documents/hf_pxi_enc_19310515_quadragesimo-anno.html, (accessed on 08.07.2015).

such as increasing female and child labour.¹²⁸ Today, the principal idea for which the encyclical is remembered is the principle of Subsidiarity, under which social organisation and decision-making “should be kept as close to grass-roots as possible.”¹²⁹ Furthermore, in his 1937 encyclical *Divini Redemptoris* he laid out the theoretical foundations of the Church’s attitude towards Marxism which was viewed as “intrinsically wrong”.¹³⁰

2.2 POPE PIUS XII (1939-1958)

Pius XII who was a diplomat by training had to minister through World War 2 and its aftermath where, in the context of the U.S-Soviet conflict, Europe was divided between the Cold War ideological blocs.¹³¹ He was credited with initiating procedures to formulate an organic doctrine for the Church’s involvement in international life.¹³² Correspondingly, the Holy See’s informal contact with the United Nations began immediately after the organization was founded in 1945.¹³³

In setting forth his conceptions of the challenges resulting from World War 2 and the reconstruction of Europe, Pius XII emphasised the danger of communist doctrines and policies. He subsequently placed the weight of Catholic Teaching against the USSR and Allied governments (the principles of the transcendent dignity and destiny of the person ran counter to communist teaching), furthermore recognizing a need for a working relationship with Western governments.¹³⁴ Moreover, during the earlier years of the Cold War, democratic political parties in France, Belgium, Italy, Netherlands, and West Germany played a large role in Europe’s economic and political reconstruction, and were often influenced by Catholic Teaching.¹³⁵ Although Pius XII’s teachings reveal his desire to not simply be a “voice for the West”, the Church’s *de facto* position translated into moral and

¹²⁸ Esdaille.

¹²⁹ Esdaille.

¹³⁰ Bryan Hehir, “Papal Foreign Policy”, **Foreign Policy**, vol. 78, 1990, p. 31.

¹³¹ Hehir, p. 28.

¹³² Tomasi, p. 14.

¹³³ Tomasi, p. 14.

¹³⁴ Hehir, p. 28.

¹³⁵ Hehir, p. 29.

religious support for the Western Alliance and its struggle against the East.¹³⁶ Overall, Pius XII's diplomacy may be viewed as a form of "diplomatic containment" where the tactic was to "wait out these illegitimate regimes that were destined to fall".¹³⁷

2.3 POPE JOHN XXIII (1958-1963)

A repositioning of the Church's policy and practice took place during the pontificate of John XXIII. He was faced with a diplomatic situation that was only slightly different to that of Paul XII, as the superpowers were still locked in conflict over Berlin, and they were on nuclear alert over Cuba.¹³⁸ Nonetheless, John XXIII emphasised that the "signs of the times" demanded that adversaries, whether political or religious, should talk with each other.¹³⁹ Consequently his influence was felt in the following ways: he [1] improved Vatican-Soviet relations, [2] reformed the style of Vatican diplomacy, and [3] reshaped Catholic Social Teaching.¹⁴⁰ The first two were related. During the Cuban missile crisis he publicly urged both the U.S.S.R. and U.S. to exercise caution, which won him the respect of both President Kennedy and the Soviet leader Krushchev, and also helped him to earn the Balzan Peace prize.¹⁴¹ He then opened conversations with communist governments (under what became known as Vatican *Ostpolitik*) where the idea was to use Vatican intervention to strengthen the local Church across Eastern Europe, with the hopes of opening up discussions regarding the broader dimensions of religious freedom.¹⁴² Furthermore, John XXII also aimed to establish an intellectual basis for an extended dialogue between the Church and its adversaries and thus, in his encyclical *Pacem in Terris* – "Peace on Earth" (1963) he offered a counterpoint to Pius XI's perspective (which abstained from contact with communist regimes), and supplied a resolution of the principles

¹³⁶ Hehir, p. 29.

¹³⁷ Hehir, p. 30.

¹³⁸ Hehir, p. 29.

¹³⁹ Hehir, p. 29.

¹⁴⁰ Hehir, p. 29.

¹⁴¹ Pontifical Academy of Sciences, "Blessed John XXIII", <http://www.casinapioiv.va/content/accademia/en/magisterium/johnxxiii.html>, (accessed on 01.09.2015).

¹⁴² Hehir, p. 30.

involved in dealing directly with Communist countries.¹⁴³ The encyclical additionally embraces freedom of conscience and the protection of Human Rights, before applying both of these concepts to political and economic life, concluding with a denunciation of the arms race and a call to disarmament.¹⁴⁴ John XXII also initiated a larger process of change that would influence the Church's relations with the East and the West.¹⁴⁵ In this context the Second Vatican Council (1962-1965) served as a catalyst for redefining the Church's global relations. This was largely due to the Council's final document *Gaudium et Spes* – “The Joys and Hopes” (1965) which had a systemic effect on Catholicism throughout the world¹⁴⁶ due to the fact that it highlighted the need of the Church to immerse itself in human affairs in defence of peace and human dignity, as well as share in the joys and hopes of people.¹⁴⁷ Another important Second Vatican Council document to emerge was *Dignitatis Humanae* – “Human Dignity” (1965) which promoted religious freedom and was essentially a call for Christians to respect religious freedom, the same of which should also be respected by states.¹⁴⁸

2.4 POPE PAUL VI (1963-1978)

Paul VI, who was elected in the midst of the Second Vatican Council and guided the Council to its conclusion in 1965, led the Holy See through a complex post-conciliar period.¹⁴⁹ Similar to John XXIII he was also convinced of the need to create an opening to the East, although he was faced with a different world order than his predecessors, one which saw China, Japan, and Western Europe emerging as powerful actors.¹⁵⁰ Of particular significance to him, was the increasing visibility of the third world in international affairs and he accordingly embarked on numerous travels outside Rome including, Latin America, Africa, Southeast Asia, the Middle

¹⁴³ Murphy, p. 554.

¹⁴⁴ Esdaille.

¹⁴⁵ Hehir, p. 32.

¹⁴⁶ Hehir, p. 32.

¹⁴⁷ Catholicsocialteaching.org, “Papal Encyclicals”, (Encyclicals), <http://www.catholicsocialteaching.org.uk/principles/documents/>, (accessed on 24.06.2015).

¹⁴⁸ Catholicsocialteaching.org, Encyclicals.

¹⁴⁹ Hehir, p. 33.

¹⁵⁰ Hehir, p. 33.

East, and the United Nations.¹⁵¹ He was determined to have the Church play a more vital and influential role in the changing world order and therefore began to reposition its pastoral and diplomatic activities.¹⁵² Firstly, with the intention of providing “living space” for the local Church, he expanded Vatican *Ostpolitik* by stepping up the Holy See’s contact with the governments of Eastern Europe and sending Cardinal Casaroli on official visits to Czechoslovakia, Hungary, Bulgaria, Poland, and Yugoslavia.¹⁵³ Secondly, under the leadership of Paul VI, Casaroli also became the first senior Vatican personality to officially visit the Soviet Union.¹⁵⁴ With Casaroli’s signing of the Nuclear Non-Proliferation treaty the visit served the dual purpose of reaffirming the Holy See’s interest in the nuclear question, and allowing Casaroli to meet with officials from the Council for Religious Affairs to plead the case for greater rights for Catholics in the Soviet Union.¹⁵⁵ Without departing from previous policies, Paul VI advanced the Church’s position to that of diplomatic contact with East and West, formal relationships with neither, and critical commentary of both.¹⁵⁶ Besides his critique of superpowers the second dimension of Paul VI’s policy was the establishment of the Vatican as an advocate for the needs of developing countries, particularly expressed in his 1967 encyclical *Populorum Progressio* – “The Progress of Peoples”, where he pressed the North-South question at several U.N conferences during the 70’s.¹⁵⁷ After embarking on his extensive travels and witnessing the issues that international communications were bringing to closer proximity (such as global poverty) through newer technologies such as television, *Populorum Progressio* was a call for industrialized nations to respond with charity and justice to developing nations.¹⁵⁸ Here, rather than claiming the Church as an expert in economics, the Church was claimed as an “expert in

¹⁵¹ Hehir, p. 33.

¹⁵² Hehir, p. 33.

¹⁵³ Hehir, p. 33.

¹⁵⁴ Felix Corley, “Obituary: Cardinal Agostino Casaroli”, **The Independent**, 23.10.2011, <http://www.independent.co.uk/arts-entertainment/obituary-cardinal-agostino-casaroli-1163946.html>, (accessed on 24.06.2015).

¹⁵⁵ Corley.

¹⁵⁶ Hehir, p. 33.

¹⁵⁷ Hehir, p. 34.

¹⁵⁸ Catholicsocialteaching.org, Encyclicals.

humanity” and placed the three values of solidarity, social justice, and charity at the centre of its social life.¹⁵⁹

By the time that Paul VI died in 1978, the Vatican was a stable ally to the third world whilst, contrastingly, both superpowers only received commendation from the Vatican based on specific policies such as humanitarian assistance or arms control.¹⁶⁰ Overall, through dialogue rather than confrontation, the Vatican under Paul VI’s leadership sought to help big powers define their interests in ways that took the needs of others into consideration.¹⁶¹

2.5 POPE JOHN PAUL II (1978-2005)

Pope John Paul II originated from Poland, which is especially significant when viewed in terms of the crucial role he played in the collapse of communism both in Poland and the rest of Eastern Europe.¹⁶² To this end he is credited with being the catalyst which led to the actual revolution, where his charisma helped inspire the formation of Solidarity- the first independent trade union in the communist world.¹⁶³ This was central to the downfall of communism in Poland and had a domino effect that spread throughout the Eastern Bloc.¹⁶⁴ He was also noted for being a vehement opponent of liberation theology- a movement centred in Latin America which “sought to apply religious faith by the oppressed through involvement in political and civic affairs”¹⁶⁵ - as he felt that this ideology was too close to Marxism.

John Paul’s particular teachings on economic justice, human rights and international order developed ideas from the eras between Pius XII and Paul VI, whilst his personal style of pastoral leadership, historical experience, and diplomacy set him apart from his predecessors, making him a charismatic and beloved figure.¹⁶⁶ His travels equated to more than all the other popes combined, and whilst he was always received by the host government, his preference was to keep those encounters

¹⁵⁹ Esdaille.

¹⁶⁰ Hehir, p. 35.

¹⁶¹ Hehir, p. 35.

¹⁶² Encyclopaedia Britannica, Papacy.

¹⁶³ Scott Appleby, “Pope John Paul II”, **Foreign Policy**, no. 119, 2000, p. 12.

¹⁶⁴ Appleby, p. 12.

¹⁶⁵ Encyclopaedia Britannica, “Liberation Theology”, <http://global.britannica.com/topic/liberation-theology>, (accessed on 26.08.2015).

¹⁶⁶ Hehir, p. 36.

limited and subordinate to his religious message.¹⁶⁷ Amongst the issues that he stressed were the importance of the Church's social ministry as well as work with the poor and human rights, but he also warned against politicization of the Church's efforts.¹⁶⁸

A large part of John Paul's focus was the promotion of cross-cultural and interreligious dialogue, to which he achieved great strides. This included seeking a greater reconciliation with Jews and Judaism where he [1] was the first pope to set foot in the Synagogue of Rome (1986), [2] established formal diplomatic relations with Israel (1993), and [3] made a historic pilgrimage to Jerusalem where he prayed at the Western Wall (2000).¹⁶⁹ Comparatively, on a number of issues such as birth control, abortion, homosexuality, ordination of women, and clerical marriage he retained the Church's traditional position¹⁷⁰ and despite his popularity there were some major criticisms of the Church, which emerged during his pontificate. This included criticism of his stance against the use of condoms, which some politicians and human rights workers saw as contributing towards the spread of AIDS in Africa, and various scandals surrounding the Church's handling of sexual abuse cases.¹⁷¹

Ultimately, John Paul's view of the international system was of a normative character, although it still possessed political content.¹⁷² It was guided by his moral vision of what changes were needed to create his version of a "real international system", which centred on the role of superpowers, the needs of developing countries, and the nuclear question.¹⁷³ To this end, his U.N. address of 1979, and his encyclical *Sollicitudo Rei Socialis* – "The Social Concern of the Church" (1987) are two major statements that set the framework for later commentaries during his pontificate.¹⁷⁴ A detailed assessment of his views on the role of superpowers may be found in *Sollicitudo Rei Socialis*, which was a "powerful critique of both East and West for their impact on developing countries".¹⁷⁵ During the period that it was written, the increase in refugees was seen as a major concern and a result of

¹⁶⁷ Encyclopaedia Britannica, Papacy.

¹⁶⁸ Hehir, p. 36.

¹⁶⁹ Appleby, p. 21.

¹⁷⁰ Encyclopaedia Britannica, Papacy.

¹⁷¹ Encyclopaedia Britannica, Papacy.

¹⁷² Hehir, p. 38.

¹⁷³ Hehir, p. 38.

¹⁷⁴ Hehir, p. 38.

¹⁷⁵ Hehir, p. 38.

confrontation.¹⁷⁶ The Cold War was also ongoing, and there was the severe recession of the mid-1980s whilst wealth inequalities widened as a result of ‘turbo capitalism’.¹⁷⁷ The encyclical introduced the concept of “structures of sin” which was a description of market mechanisms and social systems which cause evil such as increasing inequality, social exclusion, and ecological damage.¹⁷⁸ *Sollicitudo Rei Socialis* was also the first Papal letter that committed the whole church to “the love of preference for the poor”¹⁷⁹, and goes on to condemn the gap that existed between the rich and the poor which John Paul II also linked to arms trade.¹⁸⁰

2.6 POPE BENEDICT XVI (2005-2013)

The papacy of John Paul II and Benedict XVI are marked by a continuity where both popes had tried hard to mitigate the disintegration of moral-cultural foundations that were pervasive in 21st century democracy.¹⁸¹ Having a background as a professor, Benedict’s approach to foreign affairs focused on bringing Catholic Teaching to the world stage and proclaiming his message to a global audience.¹⁸² His pronouncements, however, were not without consequence, and in 2006 a famous diplomatic gaffe occurred during a speech at the University of Regensburg where he quoted a medieval emperor who implied that the prophet Muhammad had spread Islam through violence.¹⁸³ This forced the pope to issue an apology for the reaction it caused, and tested the Holy See’s relations with Islam majority nations.¹⁸⁴ Despite this, his comments initiated reflection and gave urgency to the ongoing Catholic-Muslim dialogue, in turn leading Saudi Arabia’s King Abdullah to visit the Vatican in 2007 and launch his own foundation aimed at promoting interreligious understanding.¹⁸⁵ Overall, Benedict XVI made 24 trips outside Italy.¹⁸⁶ These

¹⁷⁶ Catholicsocialteaching.org, Encyclicals.

¹⁷⁷ Catholicsocialteaching.org, Encyclicals.

¹⁷⁸ Esdaille.

¹⁷⁹ Esdaille.

¹⁸⁰ Catholicsocialteaching.org, Encyclicals.

¹⁸¹ Edward Pentin, “The Pope as Diplomat”, *Foreign Affairs*, 27.02.2013.

<https://www.foreignaffairs.com/articles/2013-02-27/pope-diplomat>, (accessed on 30.08.2015).

¹⁸² Pentin.

¹⁸³ Pentin.

¹⁸⁴ Pentin.

¹⁸⁵ Pentin.

¹⁸⁶ Pentin.

included trips to Israel, Turkey, the U.S. Lebanon, Cameroon and the U.K. amongst others.¹⁸⁷ Besides any diplomatic achievements, Benedict's pontificate is largely characterized by his focus on teaching the world lessons regarding how to achieve peace.¹⁸⁸ To this end, in *Deus Caritas Est* "God Is Love" (2006) and *Spe Salvi* "Saved by Hope"(2007), he offers a critique of the "foundations of the modern age" and warns against the "dangers of secularism".¹⁸⁹ *Caritas in Veritate* "Charity in Truth" (2009), however, is viewed as one of Benedict XVI's most influential writings.¹⁹⁰ At the time it was written, the global economic and banking crisis of 2008 had affected the world's poor disproportionately and environmental issues were beginning to gain traction as evidence of degradation was being produced.¹⁹¹ His message was therefore directed at a variety of concerns which included, amongst others; global poverty, injustice, the arms race, authentic human development and environmental concerns.¹⁹²

¹⁸⁷ Pentin

¹⁸⁸ Pentin.

¹⁸⁹ Encyclopaedia Britannica, Papacy.

¹⁹⁰ Catholicsocialteaching.org, Encyclicals.

¹⁹¹ Catholicsocialteaching.org, Encyclicals.

¹⁹² Catholicsocialteaching.org, Encyclicals.

CHAPTER 3: *PROVENANCE*

SOURCES OF THE VATICAN'S INFLUENCE

Now that a historical overview of the Vatican in the context of its role in world politics over the past century has been given, this thesis continues towards its objective of progressing towards an improved understanding of the Vatican's influence in world politics. Hitherto, recall that this thesis has already argued under the introductory chapter that; an observation of the principles of CST will not only be useful in helping to understand why the Vatican holds the particular political values that it does, but it will also contribute towards an overall understanding of the stimulation and creation of relations of attraction towards the Vatican, which have direct bearing on its capacity to achieve its preferred outcomes in world politics. A brief overview of these principles is consequently provided below.

3.1 THE PRINCIPLES OF CATHOLIC SOCIAL DOCTRINE

The Principle of the Dignity of the Human Person. The importance of this principle is epitomized in the fact that the focal point of Catholic Social Teaching is the human person.¹⁹³ From the Catholic perspective, "human dignity is rooted in the filial relation with God".¹⁹⁴ Under this principle, humans were created in the likeness of God and regardless of any factors or reasoning, individuals have an immeasurable worth.¹⁹⁵ Accordingly, each human life should be considered sacred and equal. In terms of the Holy See's foreign policy approach, this principle is important because

¹⁹³ Catholicsocialteaching.org, "Principles of Catholic Social Teaching", (Principles), <http://www.catholicsocialteaching.org.uk/principles/info/>, (accessed on 01.07.2015).

¹⁹⁴ Pierpaolo Donati, "Discovering the Relational Character of the Common Good", **Pursuing the Common Good: How Solidarity and Subsidiarity Can work Together**, The Proceedings of the 14th Plenary Session of the Pontifical Academy of Social Sciences, Vatican City, 2-6.05.2008, p. 667.

¹⁹⁵ John XXIII, Encyclical Letter "Pacem in Terris", 11.04.1963.

http://w2.vatican.va/content/johnxxiii/en/encyclicals/documents/hf_jxxiii_enc_11041963_pacem.html, (accessed on 01.07.2015).

- 3. "Moreover, (2a) God created man "in His own image and likeness," (3) endowed him with intelligence and freedom, and made him lord of creation."
- 9. "Any well-regulated and productive association of men in society demands the acceptance of one fundamental principle: that each individual man is truly a person. His is a nature, that is, endowed with intelligence and free will. As such he has rights and duties, which together flow as a direct consequence from his nature. These rights and duties are universal and inviolable, and therefore altogether inalienable".

it maintains relations with individual countries based on certain priorities such as the priority of the human person, his dignity, and his rights.¹⁹⁶ The principle also translates to a firm stance on issues surrounding the end and beginning of life such as abortion and the death penalty, but it also has various implications for everything in-between, e.g. how the Church addresses global inequality and how it approaches civil rights issues.¹⁹⁷ Additionally, themes such as “preferential option for the poor” and “authentic human development” have all developed from the idea that all people possess this inherent dignity.¹⁹⁸ The idea that life has value is not unique to Catholic Social Teaching and shares a lot in common with international human rights, but the Catholic perspective differs slightly in that it grounds human dignity in the foundations of the Church’s tradition as foretold in the Gospel. Some important encyclicals dealing with this principle are Pope John Paul II’s *Laborem Exercens – Through Work* (1981) and Pope John XXIII’s *Pacem in Terris – Peace on Earth* (1963).

The Principle of the Common Good. Under this principle, the web of relations which human beings establish amongst each other has an important role, because this web is important for the human being to reach fulfilment. Essentially then, each human being places himself at the centre of a web which is formed by concentric circles that include family, home, workplace, neighbours, the nation, and finally, humanity. Human beings therefore draw the necessary elements from these circles for their growth, whilst at the same time contributing towards the improvement of these circles. What a person does not have the ability to obtain by himself, but is able to receive “due to his quality as a social being” is the common good.¹⁹⁹ Consequently, it may be understood as the set of conditions which allows a person to become more human, because even when considered in terms of exterior aspects such as economy, social justice, security, or access to education, it is always

¹⁹⁶ Tauran.

¹⁹⁷ Catholicsocialteaching.org. “Human Dignity”, (Dignity), <http://www.catholicsocialteaching.org.uk/themes/human-dignity/>, (accessed on 24.06.2015).

¹⁹⁸ Catholicsocialteaching.org, Dignity.

¹⁹⁹ Roland Minnerath, “The Fundamental Principles of Social Doctrine. The Issue of their Interpretation”, **Pursuing the Common Good: How Solidarity and Subsidiarity Can work Together**, The Proceedings of the 14th Plenary Session of the Pontifical Academy of Social Sciences, Vatican City, 2-6.05.2008, p. 49.

a human good.²⁰⁰ One of the guiding thoughts under this principle is that public authorities should promote the common good and exist to ensure that there is no section of the population that is excluded.²⁰¹ Pursuit of the common good may also allow a society to “mobilise the energies of all its members”, e.g. when it becomes necessary to defend itself against an aggression. Additionally, the common good, which exists at each level of society, may sometimes require sacrifice of the individual good. According to John XXIII’s Encyclical *Pacem in Terris*, in order for the common good to be discerned and achieved the presence of some fundamental conditions are necessary: freedom, justice, truth and solidarity.²⁰² These four social virtues respond to man’s natural inclinations and must be pursued together in order to achieve the common good, because if any of these conditions are not met then “the city is no longer humanising, but becomes oppressive or anarchic”.²⁰³ Another Encyclical which addresses important aspects of this principle is Pope John Paul II’s *Sollicitudo Rei Socialis – The Social Concern of the Church* (1987).²⁰⁴

The Principle of Solidarity. John Paul II tells us the following about solidarity in *Sollicitudo Rei Socialis*:

Solidarity helps us to see the “other” – whether a person, people or nation – ...as our “neighbour”, a “helper” (cf. Gen 2:18-20), to be made a sharer, on a par with ourselves, in the banquet of life to which all are equally invited by God.

Under the Church’s view of solidarity, as members of one human family humans possess a mutual obligation to promote the development and rights of peoples across nations and communities.²⁰⁵ Solidarity itself is therefore more than just the “organised solidarity of our societies”,²⁰⁶ it is a combination of the fundamental bond of unity which occurs with our fellow human beings, and the

²⁰⁰ Minnerath, p. 49.

²⁰¹ Catholicsocialteaching.org, Principles.

²⁰² Minnerath, p. 49.

²⁰³ Minnerath, p. 49.

²⁰⁴ Catholicsocialteaching.org, Principles.

²⁰⁵ Catholicsocialteaching.org, Principles.

²⁰⁶ Minnerath, p. 50.

interdependence that occurs as a result.²⁰⁷ Since it is rooted in man's very nature (man is a social being) it should be organised at both the society level and the international relations level.²⁰⁸ As a principal of political and social organisation it is also one of the conditions necessary for the achievement of the common good, where "intergenerational solidarity" takes the form of solidarity with those marginalised by the economic system, impaired by social welfare, or the weak in general.²⁰⁹ Consequently, solidarity may also be understood in terms of its value as one of the moral virtues that determines institutional order. Apart from John Paul II's *Sollicitudo Rei Socialis*, some foundations of this principle are also set forth in Pope Paul VI's *Populorum Progressio -The Progress of the Peoples* (1976) and Pope John Paul II's *Centesimus Annus – The One Hundredth Year* (1991).

The Principle of Subsidiarity. Underscoring this principle is that all power and decision making in society should be at "the most local level compatible with the common good"²¹⁰ or, in other words, power and decision making in society should be handled by the least centralized competent authority. This essentially means that where possible, political decisions should be taken at a local level (power is passed downwards, but there is also the possibility of passing the appropriate powers upwards). A subsidiarity state is voluntarist and tries to curb two tendencies: [1] individual demand for maximum protection (welfare state), and [2] authority's tendency to invade all domains (centralising Jacobin State).²¹¹ The following extract which succinctly elaborates the Church's view on subsidiarity, is from the *Catechism of the Catholic Church*:

"Excessive intervention by the state can threaten personal freedom and initiative. The teaching of the Church has elaborated the principle of subsidiarity, according to which "a community of a higher order should not interfere in the internal life of a community of a lower order, depriving the latter of its functions, but rather should support it in case of need and help to

²⁰⁷ Catholicsocialteaching.org, Principles.

²⁰⁸ Minnerath, p. 50.

²⁰⁹ Minnerath, p. 51.

²¹⁰ Catholicsocialteaching.org, Principles.

²¹¹ Minnerath, p. 54.

co- ordinate its activity with the activities of the rest of society, always with a view to the common good.”²¹²

Therefore we see that one of the implications of subsidiarity, is that it binds state intervention to the criteria of absolute necessity.²¹³ This in turn has important implications which, amongst others, leads to the Church’s concern with countries under totalitarian and dictatorial regimes. Subsidiarity “is a plea for the authentic practice of democracy” and “presumes the existence of the common good”,²¹⁴ where a balance is achieved between subsidiarity and solidarity (vertical and horizontal) through reference to the common good.²¹⁵ Of particular relevance to the principle of subsidiarity is Pope Pius XI’s encyclical *Quadragesimo Anno - On Reconstruction of the Social Order* (1931).

Now that a description of these principles has been accomplished towards an understanding of the ideational basis on which the values which are expressed through Catholic culture and the Vatican’s policies are formed, this chapter continues with its examination of the Vatican’s soft power resources.

3.2 CULTURE

3.2.1 The Church’s Social Teaching as a Manifestation of Catholic Culture

If culture is defined as the set of “values and practices that create meaning for a society”,²¹⁶ then CST may be regarded as a manifestation of Catholic culture. Co-optive power rests partially on the attractiveness of culture²¹⁷ because, when “a country’s culture includes universal values, and its policies promote values and interests that others share, it increases the probability of obtaining its desired

²¹² Catholic Church. “Catechism of the Catholic Church”, no. 1883.
http://www.vatican.va/archive/ccc_css/archive/catechism/p3s1c2a1.htm, (accessed on 25.06.2015).

²¹³ Minnerath, p. 54.

²¹⁴ Minnerath, p. 54.

²¹⁵ Catholicsocialteaching.org, Principles.

²¹⁶ Nye, Soft power, p. 23.

²¹⁷ Nye, Soft power, p. 23.

outcomes because of the relationships of attraction and duty that it creates”.²¹⁸ Therefore, the background attraction or repulsion of Catholic culture that occurs worldwide, may make it easier or more difficult for the Vatican to promote its policies. In this regard CST plays a vital role, because, as discussed above, Catholic culture and values are transmitted throughout the world via CST, viewed as part of the Church’s evangelization mission.

Important instruments of CST include documents such as the *Compendium of the Social Doctrine of the Church*, which consolidates, summarizes and asserts the Church’s teachings on social questions. Although the doctrine is directed in the first place towards Catholics, in terms of evangelization (i.e. the catechesis, teaching and formation that the Church’s social doctrine aims to inspire) it is also addressed towards all Christians, where the Church’s view is that there is a shared responsibility regarding the organization, construction, and formation of society.²¹⁹ Included in the doctrine, are a multitude of sources which form part of the Church’s teachings, from papal encyclicals, speeches, and congregations, to canon law, and international law. Particularly in the context of the Vatican’s influence in world affairs, worth noting is the role that encyclicals play, which is also illustrated through the previous chapter’s discussions concerning the Church’s varying positions on different social issues which have arisen over the course of the last century. From an etymological perspective, an encyclical is a circular letter, however in modern times the term has been associated almost exclusively with papal documents that are of the highest level of teaching that a pope can issue.²²⁰ If we concurrently take into consideration; [1] that these papal documents set forth Catholic policy²²¹ and [2] Nye’s assertions on culture (i.e. if a country’s cultures include universal values and their policies promote values and interests which are shared by others, then that country’s probability of obtaining its desired outcomes is increased), then the significant role that instruments of CST play in Vatican’s ability to obtain its preferences is further highlighted. As the papacy has “made itself a major spokesman

²¹⁸ Nye, *Soft power*, p. 23.

²¹⁹ Martino.

²²⁰ BBC.com, “Pope Francis Blames Human Selfishness for Global Warming”, 18.06.2015, <http://www.bbc.com/news/world-europe-33182065>, (accessed on 24.06.2015).

²²¹ Lee Teslik, “Pope Benedict’s First Twelve Months”, **Council on Foreign Relations**, 04.05 2006, <http://www.cfr.org/religion/pope-benedicts-first-twelve-months/p10595>, (accessed on 20.06.2015).

of the universal yearning for peace”,²²² this is particularly important for those Vatican policies which are designed to encourage the peaceful settlement of disputes. Within the context of the Vatican’s adopted conciliatory role, some themes include Pope Paul’s dramatic address before the U.N General Assembly urging for “an effective world authority”, which was also continued in his encyclical *Populorum Progressio* (1967); Pope John XXIII’s *Pacem in Terris* (1963), which limits the concept of a just war; and the Church’s many teachings on disarmament, which argue that stability stems from mutual trust.²²³

Due to the fact that questions concerning the relevance of the Church’s social teachings in today’s world receive regular attention, it is worth addressing the temporal aspects of CST. In terms of soft power resources, this is also relevant because soft theory posits that “narrow values and parochial cultures are less likely to produce soft power”.²²⁴ Therefore, Church teachings which do not take temporal elements into consideration run the risk of being viewed from this perspective. At the same time temporal consideration is also not a guarantor for attraction. For an illustration of how the Church has recently responded to an important social present-day issue, we may regard Pope Francis’ most recent encyclical *Laudato Si- Be Praised*, which “pleads with governments, religions, businesses and individuals to work together to address climate change” and also “sets a moral framework for the U.N.’s Conference on Climate Change in Paris” (beginning in November 2015).²²⁵ Due to climate change being a highly politicized issue, the encyclical has also proved quite controversial, raising questions regarding the Church’s place in science and politics.²²⁶ However, the encyclical itself states that “the Church does not presume to settle scientific questions or to replace politics”.²²⁷ Rather, its task is to guide discussions towards the deeper realities of issues and offer prudent or timely

²²² Rostow.

²²³ Rostow.

²²⁴ Nye, *Soft Power*, p. 23.

²²⁵ Elizabeth Dias, “Pope Francis Urges Climate Change Action in Encyclical”, **Time**, 18.06.2015, <http://time.com/3925736/pope-francis-climate-change-encyclical-laudato-si/>, (accessed on 20.06.2015).

²²⁶ Kathryn Lopez, “Laudato Si and the Common Good”, **National Review**, 22.06.2015, <http://www.nationalreview.com/article/420100/laudato-si-and-common-good-kathryn-jean-lopez>, (accessed on 20.06.2015).

²²⁷ Lopez.

advice.²²⁸ To this end, *Laudato Si* may also be considered in line with conclusions emerging from the Second Vatican Council that highlight the Church's "self-appointed mission of scrutinizing the signs of the times and interpreting them in light of the Gospel".²²⁹ Hence, Church documents such as encyclicals and the *Compendium of the Social Doctrine of the Church*, which contain the Church's teachings and policies, are viewed as vital sources of Christian 'discernment' - (based on reading the signs of the times in the light of the word of God with the purpose of giving direction to community and personal action).²³⁰

Overall then, taking the above into consideration along with this chapter's previous discussions regarding the importance of ideas and values, it becomes apparent that as a manifestation of Catholic culture and instrument of catholic values, CST plays a vital role in the Vatican's ability to achieve its preferred outcomes, where its efficacy depends largely on its ability to tap into the "deep chords of common humanity" that cultivate admiration, emulation and attraction.²³¹

3.2.2 Lifestyle

In differentiating between the various types of power Nye considers a variety of ways in which outcomes can be obtained. Regarding soft power he notes that an appeal to the senses of attraction and love can be used to persuade one to go along with another's purposes without any explicit exchange or threat taking place.²³² From a cultural perspective and similar to previously discussed notions, soft power is also created by the allure and characteristics of a lifestyle which garners great admiration, and emulation.²³³ In this vein, consider the wide range of international admiration and support that Pope Francis has managed to garner, which may also be considered a positive reflection on the Christian lifestyle itself. This favourable image is further illustrated through recent Pew Polls which have concluded that [a] Francis' image is

²²⁸ Lopez.

²²⁹ Chong.

²³⁰ Martino.

²³¹ Doyle, p. 66.

²³² Nye, *Soft Power*, p. 19.

²³³ Gallarotti, p. 22.

positive in much of the world,²³⁴ and [b] Francis is viewed favourably by both Catholics and non-Catholics alike around the world.²³⁵ So what aspects of his lifestyle then, have contributed towards this positive image?

To begin with, we may consider that one of the aspects that has generated great admiration for Francis' lifestyle, and by extension the ideal "catholic way of life", is the positive reputation he has established through leading by example. Here, Francis' particular lifestyle choices and actions have served to remind Catholics and non-Catholics alike that the Church's mission in global issues is one that emphasises love and the common good. In the first place, this is communicated through the choice of his spiritual namesake where Francis takes after the thirteenth century saint Francis of Assisi who established a reputation as a peacemaker and friend of the poor after responding to a call to rebuild the Church after a period of neglect.²³⁶ As Chong notes, although many of the preceding popes have made efforts to rally against the excesses of global capitalism, Francis has gone the furthest in "setting an example of embracing the materially marginalized".²³⁷ In this regard he has instructed the Church to strip itself of its "vanity, arrogance and pride", and humbly serve societies poorest.²³⁸ With respect to the European migrant crisis, apart from suggesting that the buildings of empty monastic orders should be used as accommodation for refugees and migrants,²³⁹ Francis recently appealed during an Angelus prayer in 2015 to "every parish, every religious community, every monastery, every sanctuary in Europe" to host a migrant family.²⁴⁰ Correspondingly, the example which Francis sets through his lifestyle, also rejects an excess of the official benefits that are

²³⁴ Pew Research Center, "Pope Francis' Image Positive in Much of the World", 11.12.2014, <http://www.pewglobal.org/2014/12/11/pope-francis-image-positive-in-much-of-world/>, (accessed on 20.06.2015).

- "Pope Francis, leader of the world's nearly 1.1 billion Catholics, enjoys broad support across much of the world, according to a new survey report by the Pew Research Centre. A median of 60% across 43 nations have a favourable view of the pontiff. Only 11% see the pope unfavourably, and 28% give no rating."

²³⁵ Noah Rayman, "5 Leadership Lessons You Can Learn From Pope Francis", *Time*, 10.03.2015, <http://time.com/3737887/pope-francis-leadership-lessons/>, (accessed on 01.07.2015).

- "In a Pew poll released last week...around the world, sixty percent of Catholic and non-Catholic respondents alike said they viewed Francis favorably"

²³⁶ Chong.

²³⁷ Chong.

²³⁸ BBC.com, "Pope Francis Urges Church to Focus on Helping Poor", 4.10.2013, (Helping Poor), <http://www.bbc.com/news/world-europe-24391800>, (accessed on 16.10.15).

²³⁹ BBC.com, Helping Poor.

²⁴⁰ BBC.com, "Migrant Crisis: Activist Convoy Drives to Hungary", 17.10.2015, <http://www.bbc.com/news/world-europe-34166882>, (accessed on 16.10.15).

normally accorded to Heads of State whilst encouraging the imitation of meaningful themes that are emphasised through leading a ‘Christian’ lifestyle, such as humility.²⁴¹ E.g., in terms of their official residence, under Vatican tradition popes are normally assigned apostolic apartments. However, after Francis first viewed his assigned apartment in 2013 he is reported to have commented that it was large enough “for 300 people,” opting instead to stay in a more modest Vatican residence that accommodates visiting clergy and lay people.²⁴² Furthermore, his modest lifestyle also exudes self-abnegation where despite his age, the pope has on various occasions insisted on carrying his own luggage. This includes for example, an instance that occurred whilst embarking on his first overseas voyage as head of the Roman Catholic Church to his home continent of South America (and on other subsequent occasions), where he was observed boarding the aircraft carrying his own bags.²⁴³ Another gesture which exudes humility is his personal response to Catholics and non-Catholics worldwide who have written to him seeking counsel during situations of distress.²⁴⁴ Actions such as the above-discussed further correspond with the findings of another pew Poll which conclude that, in a survey taken amongst U.S Catholics, nine out of ten or more say that Francis is “compassionate”, “humble” or “open minded”. The Pope in his primary role as the spiritual head of the Catholic Church is noted to exert a “profound and incalculable” spiritual and cultural influence by “helping to shape men’s minds and the motives which govern their actions”.²⁴⁵ Ultimately then in terms of lifestyle, the significance that positive examples set forth by Catholic leadership holds for Vatican’s soft power capabilities,

²⁴¹ Elise Harris, ”Holy Week Is About Humility – There Is No Other Way, Pope Says”, **Catholic News Agency**, 29.03.2015, <http://www.catholicnewsagency.com/news/holy-week-is-about-humility-there-is-no-other-way-pope-says-42218/>, (accessed on 14.07.2015).

- [Pope Francis Preaching in St Peter’s square] “By taking on the “form of a slave,” Jesus shows us that true humility is expressed in service to others, and consists of stripping and emptying oneself of worldliness so as to make room for God”

²⁴² Nick Squires, “Pope Francis Shunned Official Papal Apartments to Live Normal Life”, **The Telegraph**, 29.05.2013, <http://www.telegraph.co.uk/news/worldnews/the-pope/10086876/Pope-Francis-shunned-official-papal-apartments-to-live-normal-life.html>, (accessed on 14.07.2015).

²⁴³ Lizzy Davies, “Pope Francis Leaves for Brazil Visit – Carrying His Own Bag”, **The Guardian**, 22.07.2013, <http://www.theguardian.com/world/2013/jul/22/pope-francis-leaves-brazil-visit>, (accessed on 14.07.2015).

²⁴⁴ Chong.

²⁴⁵ Rostow.

may be assessed in terms of Nye's assertions that "if a leader represents values that others want to follow it will cost less to lead" because "the ability to establish preferences tends to be associated with intangible assets such as an attractive personality..."²⁴⁶ Taking the above into consideration, the role of lifestyle as a source of Vatican's soft power becomes evident where in a present-day context, the example set by Pope Francis as a leader who lives an 'approving' lifestyle that inspires emulation has favourable connotations towards Catholic culture as a whole and, in Nye's words, "if a country's culture is attractive, others more willingly follow".²⁴⁷

3.2.3 Visits and Personal Contact

Another way in which we may attain a better understanding of the Vatican's influence in world affairs is if we consider its role as a focal point for a vast cultural and spiritual community, and as a visible symbol of a living system of ideas and values.²⁴⁸ Due to this symbolic and spiritual significance, the Vatican receives a multitude of visitors yearly. Within the scope of this examination and of relevance at this point is Nye's assertion that culture may be transmitted through personal contacts, exchanges, and visits.²⁴⁹ If a country's soft power resources include culture, and culture is transmitted through personal contacts, exchanges, and visits, then this thesis finds it pertinent to continue by considering the following.

According to L'Osservatore Romano, in 2011 it was recorded that the number of visitors to Vatican museums surpassed 5 million for the first time.²⁵⁰ The Vatican City itself, has a reputation as one of the most sacred places in Christendom due to its rich history and spiritual venture.²⁵¹ Its direct and tangible links with the history of Christianity add to its universal value which is reflected by the status accorded to it by UNESCO as a world heritage site. Within the boundaries of the Vatican-City, a collection of artistic and architectural masterpieces are contained. For

²⁴⁶ Nye (2004), p. 19.

²⁴⁷ Nye (2004), p. 22.

²⁴⁸ Rostow.

²⁴⁹ Nye, *Soft Power*, p. 25.

²⁵⁰ Catholic News Service, "Number of Vatican Museums' Visitors Tops 5 Million", 01.11.2012, <http://www.catholicnews.com/services/englishnews/2012/news-briefs-cns-1200139.cfm>, (accessed on 16.07.2015).

²⁵¹ UNESCO, "Vatican City". <http://whc.unesco.org/en/list/286>, (accessed on 17.07.2015).

example, St Peter's Basilica which is the world's largest religious building, incorporates the works of such famous artists as Michelangelo, Raphael, Bramante and Bernini. Moreover, the civil and sacred buildings contained within the Vatican which have been in use for centuries, maintain their religious, cultural, institutional and diplomatic functions. This in turn continues to attract millions of visitors yearly. Therefore, when considered in conjunction with Nye's assertions linking visits and personal contact to soft power, the Vatican's continual attraction of both public and official visitors may be regarded as an important cultural source of the Vatican's soft power.

3.3 INSTITUTIONS

Gallarotti categorizes one of the rubrics of the domestic sources of soft power, as the power inherent in political institutions,²⁵² where he notes that according to Huntington's *Political Order in Changing Societies* (1971), institutions should be founded on principles of democratic agency, and "be oriented around the political empowerment of civil society and reducing political gaps".²⁵³ These assertions are further appreciated by Nye's prescriptions regarding domestic sources of soft power that the way nations behave at home may enhance their perceived image and legitimacy, which may in turn advance their foreign policy objectives.²⁵⁴ In terms of democratic systems, the Church's teachings and traditional stance point out the benefits of democratic forms of government, whilst still articulating the potential dangers of such systems.²⁵⁵ In this way, a support for democratic systems is emphasized, but only those which occur under 'authentic' conditions. In his encyclical *Centesimus Annus*, Pope John Paul states that authentic democracy:

...requires that the necessary conditions be present for the advancement both of the individual through education and formation in true ideals, and of the

²⁵² Gallarotti, p. 21.

²⁵³ Gallarotti, p. 22.

²⁵⁴ Gallarotti, p. 21.

²⁵⁵ Andrew Greenwall, "Catholic Social Doctrine: What Does the Church Teach About Democracy and Values?" **Catholic Online**, 27.03.2012, <http://www.catholic.org/news/politics/story.php?id=45377>, (accessed on 17.07.2015).

*'subjectivity' of society through the creation of structures of participation and shared responsibility.*²⁵⁶

Furthermore, in a lecture by Archbishop Jean-Louis Tauran on *The Theme of The Presence of the Holy See in the International Organizations*, Tauran asserts that the Holy See's daily action on the international scene provides its "support to all institutions that foster democracy as the basis of political and social life" where "democracy means participation and co-responsibility".²⁵⁷ He notes that "the Pope (John Paul II) has often repeated that for democracy to be fruitful, it must be supported by human values". In this vein there is also an emphasis on the Church's concern with totalitarian regimes because, as John Paul asserts "a democracy without values easily turns into openly or thinly disguised totalitarianism".²⁵⁸ Ultimately then in line with the above, this paper views the Vatican's position on democratic systems as complementary to this headings initial institutional prescriptions for soft power sources. In a present-day context, we are provided with examples of the Vatican's position by pope Francis' call to MEP's in the European Parliament during November 2014 to "keep democracy alive"²⁵⁹ as well as recent calls at the end of his eight day tour in July 2015 for consolidation of democracy in South America,²⁶⁰ where under the tenets of soft theory the implication of the Vatican's promotion of this widely shared political value of democracy is that it may "enhance its perceived image and legitimacy".²⁶¹ Complimentarily, by using commonly supported institutions to encourage other countries to "channel or limit their activities in ways it prefers" it may not need to use as many costly "carrots and sticks".²⁶²

Of further relevance in the context of political institutions is that a well-functioning of government bureaucracy may also contribute to a country's image.²⁶³

²⁵⁶ Martin.

²⁵⁷ Tauran.

²⁵⁸ Tauran.

²⁵⁹ RTE News, "Pope Criticises 'Elderly' Europe in Speech to Parliament", 25.11.2014, (Parliament), <http://www.rte.ie/news/2014/1125/662250-pope-francis/>, (accessed 19.07.2015).

²⁶⁰ Philip Pullella, "Pope Urges Paraguay to Consolidate Democracy, End Drug Trade, Graft", **Reuters**, 10.07.2015, <http://www.reuters.com/article/2015/07/10/us-pope-latam-paraguay-idUSKCN0PK2ML20150710>, (accessed on 19.07.2015).

²⁶¹ Gallarotti, p. 22.

²⁶² Nye, *Soft Power*, p. 23.

²⁶³ Gallarotti, p. 23.

To this end, it is worth referring to recent Pew Polls amongst U.S. Catholics which indicate that 63% of respondents gave pope Francis positive ratings in his job of reforming the Vatican's bureaucracy.²⁶⁴ It is no secret that Francis has initiated many reforms of the Vatican's institutions, especially where corruption is concerned as this element serves as an antithesis to his fight against global inequalities and economic injustice. As part of the reforms implemented by Francis, management of the Vatican Bank which is officially known as the Institute for Religious Works (IOR), was replaced in order to stamp out corruption. Consequently, the IOR was reported to have seen a sharp jump in its profits for 2014 where the bank earned 69.3 million Euros compared to just 2.9 million Euros in 2013.²⁶⁵ Additionally, in February 2014, as part of the reforms he created the Secretariat of the Economy to oversee the Holy See's financial and administrative operations.²⁶⁶ Turning to Vatican officials to set an example, he also reduced the stipends of Cardinals serving in the Curia (the Vatican's equivalent of formal state bureaucracy), and "asked that they reconsider themselves as servants of the Church of lay people instead of being controllers of a far flung super-state".²⁶⁷ Other negative publicity which has long beleaguered the Vatican includes controversy surrounding the Church's perceived cover-up of sex abuse scandals. Again, Francis has attempted to mitigate the negative implications that these scandals have held for the Church's image, and even though the issue still remains contentious, he has been credited for going further than his predecessors in addressing the scandals. For example, at a meeting which took place in Vatican-City during 2014, Francis offered an "unqualified apology for the sins of his priests" to six victims of sex abuse from the UK, Germany, and Ireland.²⁶⁸ He then subsequently established a 16 member committee for child protection in the Church, which is chaired by Cardinal O'Malley of Boston.²⁶⁹ Furthermore, in a report by Vatican Radio, Francis asked for forgiveness for the "evil" damage that sexual

²⁶⁴ Pew Research Center, "Catholics Divided Over Global Warming", 16.06.2015, p. 5, <http://www.pewforum.org/2015/06/16/catholics-divided-over-global-warming/>, (accessed on 19.07.2015)

²⁶⁵ BBC.com, "Vatican Bank Sees a 20-Fold Increase in Earnings", 25.05.2015, <http://www.bbc.com/news/business-32879571>, (accessed on 20.07.2015).

²⁶⁶ CIA.gov, "Holy See (Vatican City)". <https://www.cia.gov/library/publications/the-world-factbook/geos/vt.html>, (accessed on 20.07.2015).

²⁶⁷ Chong.

²⁶⁸ Willey.

²⁶⁹ Willey.

abusers have caused to children, adding that “sanctions” would be imposed,²⁷⁰ whilst more recently at a public address in St Peter’s Square during October 2015, he again apologized and asked forgiveness “in the name of the Church for the scandals that have happened.”²⁷¹ Through these examples we find that although the image of Vatican’s institutions has suffered in the past from a bureaucracy plagued by counteractive forces which have served to undermine its moral authority, the recent actions and reforms undertaken by Francis are likely to positively impact its image and conjure relations of attraction thereby contributing towards its ability to establish its desired preferences.

3.4 A RESPECT FOR INTERNATIONAL LAW, NORMS & INSTITUTIONS

With respect to international sources of soft power, when nations exhibit a pronounced respect for international law, institutions and norms, their commitment to ‘the rules’ radiates admirable characteristics such as dependability, legitimacy, sensitivity and a disposition against violence. A display of this general commitment “is the principal source of international soft power”.²⁷² Where the Vatican is concerned, in the first place we are provided with a demonstration of the regard that it accords to international law, by the fact that references from international law are enshrined in the *Compendium of the Social Doctrine of the Church* (mentioned earlier as one of the core documents of Catholic Social Teaching). These include references from the *Charter of the United Nations* (1945), the *Universal Declaration of Human Rights* (1948) and the *Convention on the Rights of the Child* (1990).

Furthermore, in a present-day context some examples of the Vatican’s emphasis on the necessity of respect for international law and norms are contained within Francis’ *Speech to the Members of the Diplomatic Corps Accredited to the Holy See* (2015). In this vein, whilst referring to the crisis in Ukraine he notes:

²⁷⁰ BBC.com, “The Vatican’s Child Abuse Response”, 11.04.2014, <http://www.bbc.com/news/world-europe-25757218>, (accessed on 16.10.2015).

²⁷¹ Alexandra Sifferlin, “Pope Francis Apologizes for Vatican Scandals”, *Time*, 14.10.2015, <http://time.com/4073933/pope-francis-apologizes-vatican/>, (accessed on 16.10.2015).

²⁷² Gallarotti, p. 20.

*It is my hope that through dialogue the efforts presently being made to end the hostilities will be consolidated, and that the parties involved will embark as quickly as possible, in a renewed spirit of respect for international law, upon the path of mutual trust and fraternal reconciliation, with the aim of bringing an end to the present crisis.*²⁷³

Relative to the above extract, the Vatican's regard for this political value (respect for international law) where conflict is concerned, contributes towards an image which radiates those earlier-mentioned admirable characteristics of dependability, legitimacy and disposition against violence. Francis' comments regarding the conflict in Syria and Iraq during the same speech reiterate the same value:

*In the face of such unjust aggression, which also strikes Christians and other ethnic and religious groups in the region – the Yazidis for example – a unanimous response is needed, one which, within the framework of international law, can end the spread of acts of violence, restore harmony and heal the deep wounds which the ongoing conflicts have caused.*²⁷⁴

Moreover, concerning the Syrian conflict, Francis had also penned a letter to President Vladimir Putin during September 2013. The letter itself underscores the principle of human dignity where it notes that “the world economy will only develop if it allows a dignified way of life for all human beings”.²⁷⁵ To this end he articulates his views that armed conflicts negate international harmony and that violence never leads to peace, which is a necessary condition for development.²⁷⁶ These arguments are then used as a basis to urge Putin to persuade the participants in the Syrian

²⁷³ Francis I, “Address of His Holiness Pope Francis to the Members of the Diplomatic Corps Accredited to the Holy See”, 12.01.2015, (Diplomatic Corps), http://w2.vatican.va/content/francesco/en/speeches/2015/january/documents/papa-francesco_20150112_corpo-diplomatico.html, (accessed on 20.07.2015).

²⁷⁴ Francis I, Diplomatic Corps.

²⁷⁵ Francis I, “Letter of Pope Francis to H. E. Mr. Vladimir Putin, President of the Russian Federation, on the Occasion Of The G20 St. Petersburg Summit”, 4.09.2013, (Putin), https://w2.vatican.va/content/francesco/en/letters/2013/documents/papa-francesco_20130904_putin-g20.html, (accessed on, 12.12.2015).

²⁷⁶ Francis I, Putin.

conflict “to help find ways to overcome the conflicting positions and lay aside the futile pursuit of a military solution”.²⁷⁷

Regarding the immigration predicament facing Europe, included in Francis’ 2015 *Speech*, was an appeal to international organisations to assist in the resolution of humanitarian “issues”. Here, Francis has also applied pressure on the EU to revise and amend its closed door policies, arguing that migrants need “acceptance and assistance”.²⁷⁸ For example, in a speech to the European Parliament in November 2014, he made a plea to the EU to “rediscover its founding principles of ‘bridging divisions and fostering peace and fellowship’ whilst further emphasizing the value of life and the centrality of human dignity.”²⁷⁹

Ultimately then, we find that the Vatican’s respect for international law, norms and institutions, is evident in both its ideologically rooted foreign policy and its universally valued objectives. In both, a disposition against violence is commonly underscored. Consequently, the Vatican’s predilection towards a respect for international law, norms and institutions may indeed be understood as a principal source of its international soft power.

3.5 A FUNDAMENTAL RELIANCE ON MULTILATERALISM

With regards to international soft power resources, it is also important for nations to adopt a multilateral disposition and spurn an overly unilateralist posture in the promotion of their foreign policies.²⁸⁰ This is because nations that forgo considerations of multilateral fora in response to problems or threats, may potentially alienate regime members. The implication therefore, is that they face the risk of marginalization in those regimes, which consequently jeopardizes the possibility of using those fora as viable options to attend to foreign objectives.²⁸¹ Where the Vatican is concerned, multilateral fora are an extremely important instrument in achieving its peaceful objectives:

²⁷⁷ Francis I, Putin.

²⁷⁸ Catherine Mayer, “Pope Urges ‘Aged and Weary’ Europe to Accept Migrants and Reject Hunger”, **Time**, 25.11.2014, <http://time.com/3604648/pope-francis-european-parliament/>, (accessed on 01.10.2015).

²⁷⁹ Mayer.

²⁸⁰ Gallarotti, p. 21.

²⁸¹ Gallarotti, p. 21.

*...there can be no true human progress nor durable peace without the courageous, loyal, disinterested search of a growing cooperation and unity among the peoples. For this reason the Church encourages every initiative that can be undertaken, every step that can be realized, both on a bilateral and multilateral level- John Paul II.*²⁸²

Of course, it is relevant to emphasise here again before proceeding that technically, the subject which enters into contact with leading figures in international life is not the Catholic Church, but the Holy See, i.e. the Pope and the Roman Curia.²⁸³ Within nations, one of the ways that the Holy See's action as a moral authority is carried out is through its relations with governmental organizations, or multilateral diplomacy. Essentially, this consists of its relations with the United Nations and its Agencies, the Council of Europe, the European Union, the Organization for Security and Cooperation in Europe, the Organization of American States, and the Organization for African Unity.²⁸⁴ Due to its large membership, the United Nations is considered "a privileged stage",²⁸⁵ where the Holy See may easily address its global concerns. These are based on the values it represents, defends and promotes.²⁸⁶ For this reason it has chosen to enjoy "observer status", but with the right to speak, as this permits it to remain neutral whilst reinforcing its position as a moral authority. The message that it stresses to the U.N. which, as mentioned is based on its values, emphasises the equality of nations and an "international common good".²⁸⁷ In this context therefore, war should always be rejected and priority should be given to negotiation and the use of juridical instruments.²⁸⁸ The result is that its activity has often helped to stimulate a climate of trust between international partners. Since the U.N. treats the Holy See as a State, it is also fully able to participate and vote in conferences. This is important because during UN

²⁸² Silvano Tomasi, "Why is the Holy See Engaged in International Life?", **International Catholic Organizations and Catholic Inspired NGO's: Their Contribution to the Building of the International Community**, Chambesy: MathiasNebel, 2012, p. 37.

²⁸³ Tauran.

²⁸⁴ Tauran.

²⁸⁵ Tauran.

²⁸⁶ Tomasi, p. 37.

²⁸⁷ Tauran.

²⁸⁸ Tauran.

conferences, states adopt a Programme of Action, which is an “enabling” document that provides activists with a basis to lobby where “governments may be called upon to justify their action and inaction”.²⁸⁹ As a place where norms are articulated and debated then, the UN conference is important for international law-making. Some examples of important conferences which the Holy See has participated in include the 1992 United Nations Conference on Environment and Development, and the 1993 Vienna Conference on Human Rights. Finally, the fact that the Holy See possesses the necessary personality to legally ratify treaties also means that it is largely involved in the negotiation of universal international law-making treaties that take place under the auspices of the UN. In terms of Vatican’s international sources of soft power then, we may conclude that multilateralism plays an important role because, [1] its activities in multilateral fora (such as the UN) are conducive towards the stimulation of a trustful climate amongst its international partners. This in turn makes it easier for it to plead for its preferences such as “a gradual decrease in military expenditure, respect for cultures/religious tradition, effective disarmament, and solidarity with poorer countries”;²⁹⁰ and [2] it is well-positioned to shape international rules that are consistent with its values and interests. This increases the likelihood of its actions appearing legitimate in the eyes of others, and legitimacy means less resistance to its wishes.²⁹¹ For these reasons multilateral fora play a vital role in the Vatican’s ability to establish its preferences.

3.6 A GLOBAL WORLDVIEW: EMPHASIS ON THE SHARED PROMOTION OF THE WELFARE OF THE INTERNATIONAL COMMUNITY

If nations display a willingness to forgo their own particularistic interests in pursuit of contributing towards collaborative schemes that are intended to address important multilateral problems, and are also consistent with international commitments and fair play, then they will manage to garner considerable respect

²⁸⁹ Yasmin Abdullah, “The Holy See at United Nations Conferences: State or Church”, **Columbia Law Review**, vol. 96, no.7, 1996, p. 1841.

²⁹⁰ Tauran.

²⁹¹ Nye, *Soft Power*, p. 22.

where greater commitments will further elevate the national image.²⁹² Observed earlier in this chapter, the fundamental principle of the common good, which may also require the sacrifice of the individual good,²⁹³ underscores the Vatican's global worldview which speaks directly towards a shared promotion of the welfare of the international community. As illustrated earlier through Archbishop Tauran's lecture *On the Theme of the Presence of the Holy See in the International Organizations*, in the Holy See's general message to the members of the United Nations we find that pope John Paul has frequently used the expression of "family of nations" in order to underscore the "international common good".²⁹⁴ In a present-day context, the emphasis that Vatican places on nations' collaboration regarding important multilateral problems facing the world such as the current migration challenge facing Europe, threats against minority Christian communities in Africa and the Middle East, poverty, religious fundamentalism etc., is again witnessed when observing Francis' *Speech to the Members of the Diplomatic Corps Accredited to the Holy See* (2015).

In this vein it is also important to note however, that the Vatican engages not only in collaborative efforts with states, but with non-governmental organizations as well. With regards to important NGO's conducting charity work that is in consonance with Vatican's disposition towards the common good, organizations such as Caritas Internationalis, Franciscans International, Catholic relief services, and the Communities of Saint' Egidio, provide valuable contributions towards the delivery of much long-term and emergency aid to the poor and victims of natural disasters.²⁹⁵ Efforts such as these often receive less attention than those of interventions from more well-known organizations such as Amnesty International, Human Rights watch, Oxfam and Red-Cross, but are nonetheless equally important for the provision of relief and education to conflict-stricken and vulnerable areas.²⁹⁶ Often these organizations rely on the Vatican for both political support, and the Pope's appeal to the faithful for donations.²⁹⁷ In terms of soft-power, the relevance of

²⁹² Gallarotti, p. 21.

²⁹³ Minnerath, p. 49.

²⁹⁴ Tauran.

²⁹⁵ Chong.

²⁹⁶ Chong.

²⁹⁷ Chong.

this emphasis on the interdependent relationships held between the Vatican and NGO's is elucidated through a consideration of the following: [1] Nongovernmental organizations have the ability to develop new norms by altering public perceptions on what governments and leaders should be doing, and pressing them to change policies;²⁹⁸ and [2] as NGO's are able to attract followers, it is important for other governments to take them into account.²⁹⁹ Therefore, the collaborative relationships between Vatican and NGO's also have important implications for its relationships with other governments.



²⁹⁸ Nye, *Soft Power*, p. 87.

²⁹⁹ Nye, *Soft Power*, p. 87.

CHAPTER 4: *PROCESS*

A CASE STUDY OF THE VATICAN'S ROLE IN THE U.S.-CUBAN THAW

Under the previous chapter, this thesis pursued its objective of contributing towards an improved understanding of the Vatican's influence in world politics, by conducting an investigation into the sources of its soft power. Accordingly, through the identification of these various intangible resources, it argued that the Vatican may obtain favourable outcomes as a result of the admiration and respect that is generated from the positive image that these resources produce, which creates relationships of attraction that make it easier for the Vatican to mould the interests and preferences of other actors so that they converge closer to its own interests.

In further advancement of this dissertation's objective then, this chapter continues with a case study which demonstrates the exercise of Vatican's soft power in a present-day context, as this will hold value for an improved understanding of the *process* of Vatican's influence in world politics. As initially discussed under its introductory chapter, through a series of various positions stated in its forthcoming content analysis and process tracing, this thesis will argue that -'The relations of admiration and respect generated from the Vatican's positive image placed it in a favourable position to effectively initiate a series of conciliatory moves which encouraged dialogue and supported progression on the removal of the (interrelated) economic, humanitarian, ideological and diplomatic barriers that had previously dominated U.S.-Cuban relations, thereby contributing towards a thaw in relations between the two nations'.

However, before commencing with its chapter's main body containing the content analysis and process tracing, a brief historical overview of U.S. - Cuban relations following Fidel Castro's ascension to power is provided to serve as a contextual background.

4.1 A BRIEF HISTORY OF U.S.-CUBAN RELATIONS

During the period which followed Fidel Castro's ascent to power, relations between the U.S. and Cuba have undergone various developments, including a nuclear crisis, the U.S. economic embargo, and political hostilities. Consequently, diplomatic relations between the two countries remained stagnant well beyond the Cold War but have progressed towards normalization in 2015.³⁰⁰ The following is a review of some of the key moments which have set the tone for relations between the two nations over the latter half of the preceding century.

In 1953, Fidel Castro led an unsuccessful revolt against President Fulgencio Batista's regime, leading to his imprisonment.³⁰¹ A year after his release in 1956, Castro took to the Sierra Maestra Mountains where, with Ernesto "Che" Guevara's assistance, he waged a war against Batista's regime.³⁰² Following the U.S.'s withdrawal of military aid to Batista's government in 1958, Castro led a guerrilla army into Havana and successfully managed to overthrow the Batista regime on New Year's Eve, subsequently leading to the establishment of a socialist revolutionary state on the 1st January 1959.

Despite apprehensions about Castro's communist political ideology, the U.S. recognized Castro's government.³⁰³ However, as Castro's regime began to increase trade with the Soviet Union, hike taxes on American imports, and nationalize properties owned by the U.S., Washington responded with its own economic retaliation by cutting Cuban sugar imports, which subsequently escalated into a trade embargo.³⁰⁴

During 1961 the U.S. completely severed its diplomatic ties with Cuba and began covert operations in an attempt to overthrow Castro's regime.³⁰⁵ A botched CIA backed attempt to topple Castro's government during the Bay of Pigs Invasion

³⁰⁰ Brianna Lee and Danielle Renwick, "U.S.-Cuba Relations", **Council on Foreign Relations**, 4.08.2015,

<http://www.cfr.org/cuba/us-cuba-relations/p11113>, (accessed on 02.09.2015).

³⁰¹ Pbs.org, "Cuba/United States Timeline", 20.09.2002,

<http://www.pbs.org/now/politics/cubatimeline.html>, (accessed on 02.09.2015).

³⁰² BBC.com, "Timeline: US-Cuba Relations", 11.10.2012, (Timeline),

<http://www.bbc.com/news/world-latin-america-12159943>, (accessed on 02.09.2015).

³⁰³ BBC.com, Timeline.

³⁰⁴ Lee and Renwick.

³⁰⁵ Lee and Renwick.

resulted in Cuba's mistrust of the U.S., pushing it towards a closer alliance with the Soviet Union, where one of the outcomes was an agreement which allowed the Soviet Union to build a missile base in Cuba.³⁰⁶ The U.S. discovered these plans during 1962 after a U.S. spy plane spotted Soviet owned missiles on the ground in Cuba³⁰⁷ consequently leading to the Cuban Missile Crisis³⁰⁸ during which U.S. ships "imposed a naval quarantine around the island", and "Kennedy demanded the destruction of the missile sites".³⁰⁹ Finally, after tense negotiations, the then Soviet leader Khrushchev agreed to dismantle the weapons and the U.S. pledged not to invade Cuba. The U.S. additionally agreed to the removal of its nuclear missiles in Turkey.³¹⁰

After the events of the early 1960s, diplomatic and economic isolation formed a large part of the U.S.'s policy towards Cuba which continued even after the Soviet collapse.³¹¹ In 1962 Kennedy had imposed full blown travel and financial restrictions on Cuba which would slowly devastate the Cuban economy over the next 50 years. Washington further strengthened the embargo with both the 1992 Cuba Democracy Act under the Bush administration, and the 1996 Helms Burton Act under the Clinton administration, which state that "the embargo, may not be lifted until Cuba holds free and fair elections and transitions to a democratic government that excludes the Castros".³¹² Under Clinton's administration a whole new range of interest groups and players began to influence the U.S' policy towards Cuba.³¹³ These included; NGO's and private voluntary organizations with an interest in

³⁰⁶ BBC.com, Timeline.

³⁰⁷ Adam Epstein, "A Timeline of US-Cuba Relations since the Cuban Revolution", **Quartz**, 17.12.2014, <http://qz.com/314271/a-timeline-of-us-cuban-relations-since-the-cuban-revolution/>, (accessed on 02.09.2015).

³⁰⁸ U.S. Department of State, "The Cuban Missile Crises", <https://history.state.gov/departmenthistory/short-history/cubanmissile>, (accessed on 10.01.2016).

- In October 1962 the Kennedy administration was faced with one of its "most serious foreign policy crises". Intending to "make good" on a "promise to defend Cuba from the U.S." and pursuing closer bilateral relations between the Soviet Union and Cuba, the then Soviet Premier Nikita Khrushchev began shipping ballistic missiles to Cuba. Kennedy blockaded Cuba on 22 October 1962 and "the two sides stood on the brink of nuclear war". Six days later "Khrushchev capitulated" and the missiles were dismantled. Kennedy, in return disbanded U.S. missile sites in Turkey.

³⁰⁹ Lee and Renwick.

³¹⁰ Lee and Renwick.

³¹¹ Lee and Renwick.

³¹² Lee and Renwick.

³¹³ Soraya Marino, "U.S- Cuban Perspectives during the Clinton Administration", **Latin American Perspectives**, vol. 29, no. 4, 2002, p. 50.

sending humanitarian aid to Cuba, business groups, environmental organizations, public health groups, think tanks, and diverse representation of Cuban-Americans, which all advised on the improvement of economic and diplomatic relations.³¹⁴ Despite this, the U.S.'s policy towards Cuba continued to "accommodate traditional patterns of hostility".³¹⁵ During the early 2000s there were some efforts to transform the broken relationship, including the former U.S. President Jimmy Carter's goodwill visit to Cuba in 2002, and the visit of a 10 member bipartisan U.S. delegation in 2006 to Cuba, where the intention was to "launch a new era in U.S. - Cuba relations"; however, these efforts ultimately bore little result.³¹⁶

Following the above-mentioned, recent relations between the U.S. and Cuba include efforts by the Obama administration to transform relations. These include the easing of family travel and remittance restrictions, cultural and academic exchanges, and some resumed discussions on migration and drug trafficking, which were all effected soon after Obama came into office.³¹⁷ Those discussions, however, were ended in 2009 with the Cuban government's arrest of Mr. Alan Gross, an American communications equipment distributor. Cuba consequently made clear that they would not release Gross unless the Cuban Five (intelligence officers that were convicted in the U.S during the late 1990's of infiltrating Miami-based Cuban-American dissident groups) were freed,³¹⁸ thereby contributing towards the stalemate which preceded the recent warming of relations between the two nations.

Overall in economic terms, Cuba has suffered the greater losses between the two countries where the Cuban government has estimated a loss of roughly \$1.126 trillion due to the nearly fifty years of trade restrictions.³¹⁹ However, the economic cost of the embargo to the U.S is also high, with the U.S. Chamber of Commerce estimating that the sanctions' annual cost to the U.S. economy range from \$1.2 to

³¹⁴ Marino, p. 48.

³¹⁵ Marino, p. 48.

³¹⁶ BBC.com, Timeline.

³¹⁷ Peter Baker and Julie Davis, "A Secretive Path to Raising U.S. Flag in Cuba", **The New York Times**, 13.08 2015,

http://www.nytimes.com/2015/08/14/world/americas/a-secretive-path-to-raising-us-flag-in-cuba.html?_r=0, (accessed on 02.09.2015).

³¹⁸ Baker and Davis.

³¹⁹ Lee and Renwick.

\$3.6 billion.³²⁰ Furthermore, with at least 10 different agencies responsible for enforcing the embargo, the U.S. government devotes tens of thousands of man hours to administering the embargo each year.³²¹ The U.S. has also remained largely alone in restricting access to Cuba with the embargo long being a point of friction between the United States and its allies in Canada, South America and Europe. To this end, it not surprising that every year since 1992 the U.S has been condemned publicly in the U.N. for its maintenance of “counterproductive and worn out migration and trade restrictions against Cuba”.³²²

4.2 CONTENT ANALYSIS

A large part of the media’s emphasis on the Vatican’s role in the rapprochement thus far has been centred on [1] letters that Francis sent to President Obama and President Raul Castro encouraging a resolution between both parties, and [2] Vatican’s key hosting of U.S. Cuba negotiations. However, as is often the norm in such high-level matters, by way of official release the explicit details of such matters are often withheld for various reasons. Nevertheless, this chapter argues that in terms of satisfying its objectives, there is still much to be gained by examining an official communique from the Vatican Secretariat of State on the re-establishment of Cuban-U.S. diplomatic relations, as contained within the communique are not only the “warm congratulations” of “the Holy Father” [Pope Francis], but also references to Vatican’s involvement in the rapprochement process.³²³

In conjunction with this chapter’s particular approach which applies both constructivism and soft power theory in its explanations, there is further advantage in utilizing an official release from the Vatican’s perspective in that it provides clues as to the Vatican’s preferences. This is because constructivism emphasizes the role of norms and discourses in a state’s interests, where bureaucracies and actors play a

³²⁰ Capital Flows, “It’s Time for the U.S. To End Its Senseless Embargo Of Cuba”, **Forbes**, 26.01.2013, <http://www.forbes.com/sites/realspin/2013/01/16/its-time-for-the-u-s-to-end-its-senseless-embargo-of-cuba/#3828ce875430>, (accessed on 02.09.2015).

³²¹ Capital Flows.

³²² Capital Flows.

³²³ News.va.

central role.³²⁴ Identification of these interests and preferences are, in turn, useful for theoretical interpretations which explain soft power through relations of attraction that make it easier for nations to mould the interests and preferences of other actors so that they converge closer to its own interests. In doing so, some key phrases are identified, subsequently forming the framework for discussions under this content analysis.

4.2.1 The “Interest of the Citizens of Both Countries”

The communique from the Vatican Secretariat of State begins as follows:

*The Holy Father wishes to express his warm congratulations for the historic decision taken by the Governments of the United States of America and Cuba to establish diplomatic relations, with the aim of overcoming, in the interest of the citizens of both countries, the difficulties which have marked their recent history...*³²⁵

In the context of this analysis it is pertinent to begin by noting that the well-being of the citizens of “both countries”, is not just an interest for Cuba and the U.S., but an interest for the Vatican as well. This is not only because of the large Catholic populations that exist in both U.S and Cuba, (the Church estimates that 60 to 70 percent of the Cuban Population is nominally Catholic,³²⁶ whilst nearly a quarter of the U.S population is Catholic),³²⁷ but also because of the Vatican’s global perspective under which ideas such as the principle of human dignity (discussed in the preceding chapter) emphasise the immeasurable worth of human beings worldwide.³²⁸ In terms of the “welfare of Cuban citizens”,³²⁹ the impact of the

³²⁴ Checkel, pp. 74-75.

³²⁵ News.va.

³²⁶ GlobalSecurity.org, “Religion in Cuba”, <http://www.globalsecurity.org/military/world/cuba/religion.htm>, (accessed on 03.09.2015).

³²⁷ Sarah Parnass, “By the Numbers: Catholics in America”, **ABC News**, 28.02.2013, <http://abcnews.go.com/Politics/numbers-catholics-america/story?id=18619248>, (accessed on 03.09.2015).

³²⁸ John XXIII.

- **3.** “Moreover, (2a) God created man "in His own image and likeness," (3) endowed him with intelligence and freedom, and made him lord of creation.”

embargo on the Cuban economy and its citizens has had a profound effect. To this end the Vatican Secretary of State Pietro Parolin has noted that “the Holy See had always opposed the trade and economic embargo against Cuba because it hurt ordinary people most”.³³⁰ Despite adjustments by the U.S. which allow agricultural products and medical supplies to the island, the Cuban government has estimated that the nearly fifty years of trade restrictions have amounted to a loss of roughly \$1.126 trillion.³³¹ It is no wonder then that a 2015 public opinion poll conducted by Bendixen and Amadi International have found that 97% of Cubans favour the restoration of ties.³³² Similarly, Washington Post-ABC news research polls which were conducted shortly after the announcement in December 2014 of restoration of diplomatic ties between U.S. and Cuba, have indicated American support for lifting the Cuba embargo and travel restrictions. This is reflected by results which conclude that: [1] 64% of Americans support establishing ties with Cuba (similar to 66% in a 2009 poll), [2] 68% would like to end the trade embargo (up 11% from 2009), and [3] 74% support ending travel restrictions to Cuba (an increase of 19% from 2009).³³³ A consideration of the above would therefore reinforce any Vatican arguments that “overcoming...difficulties” is “in the interest of the citizens of both countries”.³³⁴ To this end, Nye’s soft power approach would posit that Francis’ popularity and positive image is important for the Vatican’s ability to establish its preferences, as this ability is associated with intangible assets such as (amongst others) an attractive personality and political values.³³⁵ Pew polls released during December 2014 show that Francis enjoys strong support from the U.S. with 78%

-
- 9. “Any well-regulated and productive association of men in society demands the acceptance of one fundamental principle: that each individual man is truly a person. His is a nature, that is, endowed with intelligence and free will. As such he has rights and duties, which together flow as a direct consequence from his nature. These rights and duties are universal and inviolable, and therefore altogether inalienable”.

³²⁹ News.va.

³³⁰ Phillip Pulella, “Vatican Hopes Pope's Cuba Trip Helps End U.S. Embargo”, **Reuters**, 18.09.2015, <http://uk.reuters.com/article/2015/09/18/uk-pope-cuba-idUKKCN0RH2B320150918>, (accessed on 04.09.2015).

³³¹ Lee and Renwick.

³³² Lee and Renwick.

³³³ Scott Clement, “Poll: Support Increases for Lifting Cuba Embargo, Travel Restrictions”, **The Washington Post**, 23.12.2014, <http://www.washingtonpost.com/news/the-fix/wp/2014/12/23/poll-support-increases-for-lifting-cuba-embargo-travel-restrictions/>, (accessed on 04.09.2015).

³³⁴ News.va.

³³⁵ Nye, *Soft Power*, p. 19.

viewing him favourably, whilst Latin America- which is Francis' home continent- also gave high marks with 72% saying that they have a positive opinion of him.³³⁶ This positive opinion of Francis in Latin America is further echoed through the sentiments of Cuban president Raul Castro who has publicly thanked Francis for helping to broker the thaw between Cuba and U.S., adding that "he was so impressed with the pontiff [that] he was even considering converting to Catholicism".³³⁷ From the Cuban perspective, Francis' image is augmented not only by his Latin American background, which makes him less likely to be viewed as bound by American or European worldviews, but also by Vatican's policies in the region which include; [1] attempts to unlock stalled talks between the Venezuelan government and opposition, [2] attempts to halt violence in Columbia between Farc Rebels and Government Forces, and [3] a push to end mass killings carried out by drug cartels in Mexico.³³⁸ Furthermore, in terms of Vatican-Cuban relations it is important to note that the Cuban government had long been using the U.S embargo as a justification for its policies of economic control over the island and its population.³³⁹ Although the Church has had its own problems with Havana in the past (e.g. there was "substantial involvement by Catholics in the U.S. assisted Bay of Pigs invasion in 1961"),³⁴⁰ the Vatican has kept diplomatic lines open and steadfastly opposed the American embargo³⁴¹ (e.g. John Paul had previously criticized the embargo for "causing

³³⁶ Pew Research Center, p. 2.

³³⁷ Rosie Scammell, "Castro Thanks Pope Francis for Brokering Thaw between Cuba and US", **The Guardian**, 10.05.2015, <http://www.theguardian.com/world/2015/may/10/pope-meets-cuban-president-raul-castro>, (accessed on 09.12.2015).

³³⁸ James Politi, "How Pope Francis Helped Melt the US-Cuba Freeze", **The Financial Times**, 19.12.2014, <http://www.ft.com/intl/cms/s/0/8ed59cf8-876b-11e4-8c91-00144feabdc0.html#axzz3lPxFJEXm>, (accessed on 04.09.2015).

³³⁹ Tornielli, "The Help of the Church in the Thaw in Relations between the US and Cuba", **The Vatican Insider**, 5.09.2015, <http://vaticaninsider.lastampa.it/en/the-vatican/detail/articolo/francesco-francisco-francis-castro-40964/>, (accessed on 05.09.2015).

³⁴⁰ David Kowalewski, "The Catholic Church and the Cuban Regime", **Religion in Communist Lands**, vol. 11, no. 1, 2009, p. 67.

- Two weeks after the invasion, Castro had sharply criticised "fascist and Falangist Spanglish priests [who had] come to make war on the revolution" and closed/nationalised Church schools that same day.

³⁴¹ Gaia Pianigiani and Jim Yardley, "Pope Francis Is Credited With a Crucial Role in U.S.-Cuba Agreement", **The New York Times**, 17.12.2014, http://www.nytimes.com/2014/12/18/world/americas/breakthrough-on-cuba-highlights-popes-role-as-diplomatic-broker.html?_r=0, (accessed on 04.09.2015).

hardship for ordinary people”,³⁴² whilst Francis has also repeatedly called for the embargo to be lifted).³⁴³ In consideration of the above then, this chapter argues that the relations of attraction generated by Francis’ positive image had placed him in a unique position to facilitate the dialogue process. This favourable position was ultimately conducive towards Francis’ ability to vocalize the Vatican’s preference for a lifting of the embargo whilst simultaneously imploring the Cuban government to do its part for the interests of its citizens, where a thaw in relations would improve the living conditions of the Cuban population.

4.2.2 “Humanitarian Questions of Common Interest”

*In recent months, Pope Francis wrote letters to the President of the Republic of Cuba, His Excellency Mr Raúl Castro, and the President of the United States, The Honorable Barack H. Obama, and invited them to resolve humanitarian questions of common interest, including the situation of certain prisoners...*³⁴⁴

The above excerpt from the Vatican communique illustrates, from the Vatican’s perspective, a direct action taken by Francis in an attempt to “resolve” U.S.-Cuban differences. This action is further confirmed in the *Statement by the President [Obama] on Cuba Policy Changes* where Obama notes that Pope Francis had issued a personal appeal to himself and Cuban President Raul Castro, urging them to “resolve Alan’s case, and to address Cuba’s interest in the release of three Cuban agents who have been jailed in the United States for over 15 years”.³⁴⁵ To this end, it is no secret that Human Rights issues in Cuba have continued to be of concern to U.S. policymakers, with Obama further stressing this point in the *Statement by the President on Cuba Policy Changes*.³⁴⁶ Additionally, in 2014, a Human Rights Watch report concluded that through “detentions”, “forced exile”, “beatings” and “travel restrictions”, Cuba continues to repress groups and individuals who call for basic

³⁴² Pianigiani and Yardley.

³⁴³ Politi.

³⁴⁴ News.va.

³⁴⁵ Barack Obama, “Statement by the President on Cuba Policy Changes”, 17.12.2014, <https://www.whitehouse.gov/the-press-office/2014/12/17/statement-president-cuba-policy-changes>, (accessed on 05.09.2015).

³⁴⁶ Obama.

human rights or criticize the government.³⁴⁷ Synchronicity with Francis, who is deeply engaged with matters of a humanitarian nature, therefore holds great bearing for Obama, who entered office seeking a greater engagement with Cuba. Some of Obama's earlier efforts at engaging with Cuba are reflected in his 2009 reversal of some travel and remittance restrictions which were set out by his predecessor George W. Bush. This included permitting U.S. citizens to travel to Cuba (under license) for religious and educational purposes.³⁴⁸ Correspondingly, we find a positive illustration of the weight that U.S. places on its relations with the Vatican regarding matters of a humanitarian concern when we consider that according to Vatican spokesman Father Frederico Lombardi, on the 15th December 2014 (two days before the announcement that Cuba and U.S. would begin discussions on re-establishing diplomatic relations) the U.S. asked the Vatican for help in finding "humanitarian solutions" for Guantanamo inmates.³⁴⁹ Here it is worth noting that two months earlier, Francis' speech to the International Association of Penal Law had called on countries to improve prison conditions and urged countries to "prohibit the practice of transferring prisoners to torture centres",³⁵⁰ adding that:

...these abuses will only stop if the international community firmly commits to recognizing...the principle of placing human dignity above all else...

The request for the Vatican's assistance was made by the U.S Secretary of State John Kerry and although no further details were given regarding what sort of help the U.S was seeking, a senior U.S. State department official reiterated Obama's commitment to closing Guantanamo Bay.³⁵¹ In response, Lombardi welcomed the request, noting that the Vatican stood ready to "help find adequate humanitarian

³⁴⁷ Lee and Renwick.

³⁴⁸ Lee and Renwick.

³⁴⁹ Reuters, "The U.S. is asking the Vatican for Help with Guantanamo Inmates", **Huffington Post**, 14.02.2015, http://www.huffingtonpost.com/2014/12/15/us-vatican-guantanamo_n_6328094.html, (accessed on 04.09.2015).

³⁵⁰ RTE News, "Hidden Death Penalty: Pope Francis Calls for End to Life Sentences", 24.10.2014, <https://www.rt.com/news/198772-pope-francis-death-penalty-torture/>, (accessed on 11.12.2015).

³⁵¹ Reuters.

solutions through [its] international contacts".³⁵² Shortly afterwards, media began reporting on the announcement regarding restoration of U.S.-Cuban ties, which had followed a prisoner swap where three of the "still-jailed members" of the Cuban Five (two had been released earlier on in 2011 and 2014), had been released in exchange for Rolando Trujillo (a U.S. intelligence asset who had been imprisoned for nearly twenty years in Havana). Alan Gross, the U.S. prisoner and communications distributor, had also been released on "humanitarian grounds".³⁵³ Furthermore, in a surprise announcement on 11 September 2015 (which followed a private audience at the Vatican-City in May between Raul Castro and Pope Francis) the Cuban Government announced that they would release over 3500 prisoners as a "goodwill gesture" ahead of a visit by Pope Francis.³⁵⁴ This would no doubt have been received positively by those U.S. policymakers who find concern with human rights issues in Cuba. Consequently, the above factors may be regarded as evidence of the relations of attraction to the Vatican that were essential to the mitigation of tension, and the promotion of progression on issues of a humanitarian nature, which had long proved an obstacle to U.S.-Cuban relations.

4.2.3 "A New Phase in Relations between Both Parties"

According to the Vatican communique, Francis wrote letters to Barack Obama and Raul Castro, "in order to initiate a new phase in relations between the two parties".³⁵⁵ This "new phase in relations" may therefore be viewed as one of the Vatican's preferred outcomes, as the communique provides that the Vatican took specific actions (i.e. Francis' letter writing) in pursuit of this goal. Hitherto it is pertinent to continue by elucidating some elements which have constituted the "old phase" of Cuban-U.S. relations. Thus far, included under this section's discussions of the Vatican's influence on the recent diplomatic thaw between Cuba and the U.S, this chapter has already considered the Vatican's contributions towards the mitigation of

³⁵² Agence France-Presse, "Pope Francis offers US help in closing Guantanamo", 15.12. 2014, <http://news.yahoo.com/pope-francis-offers-us-help-closing-guantanamo-220007878.html>, (accessed on 11.12.2015).

³⁵³ Lee and Renwick.

³⁵⁴ BBC.com, "Cuba to Release 3,500 Prisoners ahead of Visit by Pope", 11.09.2015. <http://www.bbc.com/news/world-latin-america-34220944>, (accessed on 13.09.2015).

³⁵⁵ News.va.

historic economic and humanitarian tensions which existed between the U.S. and Cuba. Another barrier however, which has long impeded U.S.-Cuban relations, centres on differences of an ideological nature. In the *Statement by the President on Cuba Policy Changes*,³⁵⁶ Obama notes that “after Castro took power in Cuba... the relationship between our countries [Cuba and the U.S.] played out against the backdrop of the Cold War, and America’s steadfast opposition to communism...” and “an ideological and economic barrier hardened between our two countries”. Due to the relationship between leading by example and the establishment of preferences (elaborated under the previous chapter) it is therefore relevant to note that the Church has also had its ideological differences with Cuba in the past. These differences partly stemmed from the Church’s struggle with Marxism. From a theoretical perspective, the foundation for the Church’s attitude towards Marxism remained Pope Pius XI’s 1937 encyclical *Divini Redemptoris* which stated that “Communism is intrinsically wrong”.³⁵⁷ Furthermore, the Church also feared that a Marxist government may be hostile to organized religion.³⁵⁸ Correspondingly, Fidel Castro had already proclaimed his adherence to Marxism-Leninism shortly after his triumphant entry into Havana,³⁵⁹ and under Article 54 of the Cuban Constitution, restrictions on the practice of religious belief remained in effect.³⁶⁰ Although the Cuban government never outlawed religion per se, it came close and began closing religious schools after Fidel Castro came to power in 1959.³⁶¹ Castro additionally expelled some priests and sent others to work camps or prison, including Cardinal Jaime Ortega, the current archbishop of Havana.³⁶² As previously noted, despite some divergences in the past the Vatican has steadfastly kept its diplomatic lines open with Havana.³⁶³ The Vatican’s maintenance and cultivation of its relations with Cuba in the face of ideological divergences ultimately bore positive results when during the 1990s Castro began easing prohibitions on faith by removing

³⁵⁶ Obama.

³⁵⁷ Hehir, p. 31.

³⁵⁸ Ernest Evans, “The Vatican’s Foreign Policy after the Collapse of Soviet Communism”, **World Affairs Institute**, vol. 155, no. 1, 1992, p. 28.

³⁵⁹ Kowalewski, p. 69.

³⁶⁰ Kowalewski, p. 70.

³⁶¹ Aljazeera.com, “Pope Backs US-Cuba Reconciliation”, 20.09.2015, <http://www.aljazeera.com/news/2015/09/visiting-cuba-pope-francis-reconciliation-150920061249362.html>, (accessed on 24.09.2015).

³⁶² Aljazeera.com.

³⁶³ Pianigiani and Yardley.

“constitutionally enshrined atheism” in advance of Pope John Paul II’s visit to the island.³⁶⁴ Shortly afterwards Christmas was reinstated as a public holiday in Cuba.³⁶⁵ To this end, this chapter’s perspective is that although ideological divergences previously existed between the Vatican and Cuba, ideological divergences did not define Vatican-Cuban relations. In the face of U.S.’s own ideological opposition to communism, the Vatican’s maintenance of its diplomatic relations with Havana may therefore be understood in terms of the value that such positive examples hold for relations of attraction. Consequently, the Vatican was well positioned to communicate a powerful message to both parties that the nature of “new relations” between them need not be defined by past ideological (or economic) barriers.

4.2.4 Facilitation of a “Constructive Dialogue on Delicate Matters”

*The Holy See received Delegations of the two countries in the Vatican last October and provided its good offices to facilitate a constructive dialogue on delicate matters, resulting in solutions acceptable to both Parties.*³⁶⁶

With regards to its role in the U.S. - Cuban diplomatic thaw, the above extract provides a succinct explanation of action (provision of offices) and outcome from the Vatican’s perspective, where a constructive dialogue has served as a catalyst for “solutions acceptable to both parties”. This dissertation has already emphasised that the Vatican prioritizes diplomacy and dialogue as an invaluable tool for conflict resolution. Within the framework of its relations with U.S. and Cuba, this has not only been punctuated by Francis,³⁶⁷ but also by John XXIII, where during efforts to end the Cuban missile crisis in October 1962, he concluded that the “signs of the times demanded that adversaries - religious or political - talk with each other”.³⁶⁸ Accordingly, the political value which is promoted by the Vatican is articulated as

³⁶⁴ Aljazeera.com.

³⁶⁵ Aljazeera.com.

³⁶⁶ News.va.

³⁶⁷ Francis I, Diplomatic Corps.

- “One example close to my heart of how dialogue can build bridges comes from the recent decision of the United States of America and Cuba to end a lack of communication which has endured for more than half a century, and to initiate a rapprochement for the benefit of their respective citizens.”

³⁶⁸ Hehir, p. 29.

the “culture of encounter”. When asked about Francis’ role in the rapprochement process Cardinal Pietro Parolin, Vatican Secretary of State remarked that “[Francis] has stressed the importance for the person and the groups and people to meet together...what we have called the culture of encounter”, further stating that Francis deserves credit for insisting on the line “you must talk”.³⁶⁹ Furthermore, upon his recent arrival in Havana, Francis himself called the thawing of relations between Cuba and U.S. as “a sign of the victory of the culture of encounter and dialogue”.³⁷⁰ This is important because the ability to co-opt or shape what others want can rest on the attractiveness of culture or values.³⁷¹ Hence we find that Vatican’s emphasis on this particular value was instrumental in fuelling the still-ongoing dialogue, which has led to a warming in relations between the two nations.

4.3 PROCESS TRACING

By utilizing this method, the intention is to supplement the constitutive dimensions already unearthed under the content analysis with an evolutionary representation of the process of Vatican’s role in the U.S.-Cuban thaw. As previously elaborated under the first chapter’s Methodology section, this thesis finds the combination of these methods as sufficient in addressing this chapter’s research question. In beginning with a reference to the work of Francis’ predecessors, this chapter notes that due to the interrelated nature of the variables involved, some repetition is necessary to support its arguments.

³⁶⁹ Vatican Radio, “Cardinal Parolin: on Holy See’s role in US/Cuba Agreement ”, 18.12.2014, http://en.radiovaticana.va/news/2014/12/18/cardinal_parolin_on_holy_see%E2%80%99s_role_in_us_cuba_agreement/1115269, (accessed on 26.09.2015).

³⁷⁰ VOA News, “Pope Francis Warns Cubans of Dangers of Ideology, Meets with Fidel Castro”, 20.09.2015. <http://www.voanews.com/content/pope-to-celebrate-mass-in-havanas-communist-inspired-shrine/2971107.html>, (accessed on 27.09.2015).

³⁷¹ Nye, *Soft Power*, p. 20.

4.3.1 John Paul II and Benedict Set the Stage for Francis

Prior to the pontificate of Pope Francis, two papal visits to Cuba had been undertaken. The first was by Pope John Paul II in 1998, and the second was by Pope Benedict in 2012. Despite the end of the Cold War era, Cuba remained set in its Marxist ways whilst Fidel Castro remained faithful to the ideology. However, as previously discussed, the island had begun to show signs of warming to religion with Castro beginning to ease prohibitions on faith by removing constitutionally enshrined atheism prior to John Paul II's visit. Furthermore, both pastoral visits were used as an opportunity to spur political and social change where the Vatican continued to voice its disapproval of the American embargo and there was a call to "reject immovable positions and unilateral viewpoints".³⁷² It is therefore necessary to highlight the relevance of these papal visits in the context of Vatican's role in the recent thaw in U.S-Cuban relations. In accordance with the above, this section observes that the papal visits functioned as a catalyst for a re-intimation of catholic culture and galvanised the support of Cuba's predominantly catholic population, which was fundamental towards attaining support for the mediatory role which Francis would play at a later stage. Moreover, from the U.S.'s perspective the Vatican's concern with human rights (including the situation of prisoners) which was conveyed during these visits,³⁷³ as well as its ideological concerns with communism, had positive implications in that they formed the basis for an alignment of political values on the Cuban issue.

³⁷² Benedict XVI, "Words of his Holiness Benedict XVI Havana at José Martí International Airport", 28.03.2012,

http://w2.vatican.va/content/benedict-xvi/en/speeches/2012/march/documents/hf_ben-xvi_spe_20120328_congado-cuba.html, (accessed on 29.09.2015).

³⁷³ Daniel Trotta, "Pope's Visit to Cuba Raises Prospect of Human Rights Friction", **Reuters**, 18 September 2015.

<http://www.reuters.com/article/2015/09/18/us-pope-cuba-idUSKCN0RI1IJ20150918>, (accessed on 29.09.2015).

- "During the first papal visit to Cuba in 1998, Pope John Paul II commented about prisoners of conscience, saying they suffered "an isolation and a penalty" for merely wanting to "speak their mind with respect and tolerance."
- Pope Benedict also remarked on the situation of general prisoners

4.3.2 Obama and Francis Meet for the First Time

During March 2014 Obama had his first meeting with Francis which took place at the Vatican-City.³⁷⁴ Prior to the commencement of talks Obama praised Francis claiming that he was a “great admirer” before the two continued with discussions³⁷⁵ which included America’s estranged relations with Cuba.³⁷⁶ During an interview with Vatican Radio, Kenneth Hackett, U.S. Ambassador to the Holy See, revealed that Obama had wanted to change that “old policy” (on Cuba) for a long time and Francis had “stepped in and given encouragement and support”. Furthermore, Francis’ Latin origins had put him in a favourable position by providing him with a deep familiarity with the issues at hand. The discussion which took place at the Vatican therefore sowed the seeds for an important diplomatic initiative which Francis would undertake in the pursuit of a U.S. - Cuban rapprochement, where the U.S. continued to work closely with the Vatican thereafter.

4.3.3 Francis Writes Letters to Obama and Castro

During the Cuban Missile Crisis Pope John XXIII had responded to signals from both sides that “intervention by the pope could help legitimate de-escalation of the confrontation without severe loss of face”.³⁷⁷ Similarly, the letters which Francis wrote to President Obama and President Castro during the summer of 2014 may also be interpreted as Francis’ response to the signals received from his encounter with Obama. As previously noted, contained in these letters were [1] calls to resolve the case of Alan Gross as well as three of the Cuban five who remained imprisoned in the U.S. for over 15 years,³⁷⁸ and [2] the encouragement of a closer relationship

³⁷⁴ John Hooper, “Barack Obama has first meeting with Pope Francis at Vatican”, **The Guardian**, 27 March 2014.

<http://www.theguardian.com/world/2014/mar/27/barack-obama-pope-francis-vatican>, (accessed on 01.10.2015).

³⁷⁵ Hooper.

³⁷⁶ Geoff Dyer, “U.S Cuba Script Written in Papal Library”, **Financial Times**, 17.12.2014, <http://www.ft.com/intl/cms/s/0/80bc51e8-863f-11e4-b248-00144feabdc0.html#axzz3nIwLeB7f>, (accessed on 01.10.2015).

³⁷⁷ Hehir, p. 30.

³⁷⁸ Obama.

between the two nations.³⁷⁹ Therefore, with regards to actions taken by the Vatican which have positively influenced Cuban-U.S relations, the significance of the letters should be emphasised because, rather than being a mechanical and vaguely stated desire for progression, they identified and emphasised a tangible point of departure for a way forward based on the particular but relative interests of both parties.

4.3.4 The Vatican Hosts U.S. and Cuban Delegations

Capitalizing on the accumulated diplomatic momentum, the Vatican stepped up its efforts by hosting key-negotiating sessions for Cuban and U.S. delegations at the Vatican-City during October 2014. Here, a White House official is noted to have commented that “Rome was pretty remarkable”, further adding that “when we did this meeting at the Vatican, there were portraits of popes all around us. It was very ornate. It felt like History”.³⁸⁰ Noting that culture is a source of soft power which is transmitted through personal contacts and visits, this chapter’s interpretation is that Vatican’s hosting of the Cuban and U.S. delegations served to bolster relations of attraction to the Vatican and enhanced its ability to mould the interests and preferences of the U.S. and Cuban delegations, thereby contributing towards an overall convergence of interests.

4.3.5 The U.S. Requests Vatican’s Assistance on Humanitarian Issues for “Current Inmates”.

Following the above developments, the importance of Vatican’s mediatory role in the rapprochement process was further illustrated by a request made in mid-December, by the U.S. Secretary of State John Kerry to his Vatican counterpart, which sought Vatican’s assistance in finding “adequate humanitarian solutions for current inmates”.³⁸¹ In continuation of the collaborative tone set during Obama’s trip

³⁷⁹ Obama.

³⁸⁰ Dan Roberts, “Spies, Artificial Insemination and the Pope: How Cuba Came in from the Cold”, **The Guardian**, 26.04.2015, <http://www.theguardian.com/world/2015/apr/26/usa-cuba-relations-barack-obama-pope-francis-spies>, (accessed on 01.10.2015).

³⁸¹ Ralph Boulton, “U.S. Asks Vatican for Help with Guantanamo Inmates”, **Reuters**, 15.12.2014,

to the Vatican in March, the request may be interpreted as an example of the relations of attraction in play, where shared universal values led the U.S. to seek greater collaboration with the Vatican, which had positive connotations for Vatican's conciliatory role.

4.3.6 The Ice Begins to Melt - Prisoner swops take place including the release of Alan Gross on "humanitarian grounds". The U.S. and Cuba announce that they will "seek to restore diplomatic ties". The U.S. relaxes some restrictions on Cuba. The Vatican congratulates both parties.

Shortly afterwards, in a simultaneous joint announcement by Barack Obama and Raul Castro on the 17th December 2014, it was confirmed that U.S. and Cuba would seek to restore diplomatic ties after more than 50 years of tensions. Both Presidents thanked Pope Francis for his help in brokering a deal to begin normalising the relations between the United States and Cuba,³⁸² whilst Obama additionally praised his "moral example, showing the world as it should be, rather than simply settling for the world as it is".³⁸³

Furthermore, in accordance with Kerry's earlier request to the Vatican which sought assistance on humanitarian issues for "current inmates", it was announced that U.S. communications distributor Alan Gross (whom Cuba had accused of spying) had returned home that same day having been released earlier on humanitarian grounds.³⁸⁴ In a separate prisoner exchange between the two nations, U.S. intelligence asset Rolando Trujillo had also been released that very morning, in exchange for the three remaining members of the Cuban five. The Vatican, on its end voiced its approval regarding the above developments through a Communique from the Secretariat of State which congratulated both nations on their "historic decision",

<http://www.reuters.com/article/2014/12/15/us-pope-kerry-idUSKBN0JT1WI20141215>, (accessed on 03.10.2015).

³⁸² Roberts.

³⁸³ Nick Squires, "Pope Francis Brokered US-Cuba Deal at Secret Vatican Meetings", **The Telegraph**, 17.12.2014,

<http://www.telegraph.co.uk/news/worldnews/the-pope/11300391/Pope-Francis-brokered-US-Cuba-deal-at-secret-Vatican-meetings.html>, (accessed on 03.10.2015).

³⁸⁴ Obama.

and further assured its support for initiatives undertaken in efforts to “strengthen bilateral relations”.³⁸⁵

With regards to the embargo, as noted earlier in this chapter, the Vatican had long voiced its disapproval of the U.S. policy. Although an outright end to the embargo was not announced, soon afterwards the U.S. announced some new rules which would ease the pressure of economic sanctions. These new rules allow: [1] U.S. travellers to visit Cuba without a government licence, [2] U.S. airlines to provide service to Cuba, [3] U.S. travellers to use U.S. debit and credit cards, [4] banks to facilitate authorized transactions, [5] U.S. insurance companies to provide travel, health, or life insurance for individuals visiting or living in Cuba, [6] the shipment of building materials to private Cuban companies, and [7] U.S. companies to invest in some small businesses.³⁸⁶

4.3.7 Relations between the U.S. and Cuba Continue to Thaw

Building on the momentum created by Francis’ diplomatic initiative which had insisted that the two nations “must talk”,³⁸⁷ relations between the U.S. and Cuba continued to thaw over the next couple of months. On the 22nd January 2015 Senior U.S. and Cuban diplomats met in Havana to discuss the re-opening of embassies and restoration of diplomatic ties.³⁸⁸ Three months later in April 2015, Raul Castro and Obama met on the side-lines of a regional summit in Panama in the first formal talks between the two nations’ leaders in over 50 years, where both agreed to push ahead for improved relations and restore full diplomatic ties.³⁸⁹ A few days later, the White House confirmed that Obama had notified Congress of his intention to remove Cuba from a list of state sponsors of terrorism.³⁹⁰ Cuba in turn welcomed the move, adding that it “rejects and condemns” all acts of terrorism.³⁹¹

³⁸⁵ News.va.

³⁸⁶ Lee and Renwick.

³⁸⁷ Vatican Radio.

³⁸⁸ Doina Chiacu and Francis Kerry, “U.S. and Cuba: From Cold War Hostilities to a Historic Meeting”, **Reuters**, 11.04.2015, <http://www.reuters.com/article/2015/04/11/us-cuba-usa-events-idUSKBN0N20NN20150411>, (accessed on 05.10.2015).

³⁸⁹ Chiacu and Kerry.

³⁹⁰ Sabrina Siddiqui, “Obama to Remove Cuba from List of State Sponsors of Terrorism”, **The Guardian**, 15.04.2015,

4.3.8 The Vatican Announces That Francis Will Visit Cuba on His Way to the U.S.

Following the above developments, the Vatican on its part, announced at the end of April 2015 that Francis would be visiting Cuba on his way to the U.S. in September 2015. Within the earlier Vatican communique which followed the December announcement that U.S. and Cuba would seek to restore diplomatic ties, the Vatican had stated that it would “continue to assure its support for initiatives which both nations will undertake to strengthen their bilateral relations and promote the wellbeing of their respective citizens”.³⁹² Francis’ inclusion of Cuba in his planned trip to the U.S. may thus be interpreted as a continuation of Vatican’s effort to support, encourage and consolidate the ongoing rapprochement process.

4.3.9 Francis Holds Private Audience with Raul Castro at the Vatican

During May 2014 Raul Castro met with Francis for a private audience at the Vatican. After emerging from his talks with Francis, the Cuban leader once again thanked Pope Francis for his help in brokering the diplomatic thaw between the U.S. and his country, adding that he was so impressed with the pontiff that he was considering converting to Catholicism.³⁹³ Progression on ideological issues was also signalled through Castro’s comment that “I am from the Cuban communist party, that doesn’t allow [religious] believers, but now we are allowing it, it’s an important step”.³⁹⁴

<http://www.theguardian.com/us-news/2015/apr/14/obama-remove-cuba-list-state-sponsors-terrorism>, (accessed on 06.10.2015).

³⁹¹ Siddiqui.

³⁹² News.va.

³⁹³ Scammell.

³⁹⁴ Scammell.

4.3.10 Cuba and the U.S. Restore Full Diplomatic Ties

On July 20th 2015, the U.S. and Cuba once again reopened their embassies in each other's capitals, where both had been closed since 1961. This was indeed a milestone in relations between the two nations which, as proclaimed by Raul Castro and Obama and supported through this chapter's positions, is largely attributed to the work of Francis and the Vatican. Despite this, there is still much work to be done before relations are completely normalised. At the time of writing this article, the U.S. embargo against Cuba, which needs congressional approval for it to be lifted, remains in place.³⁹⁵ John Kerry has commented during August 2015 that "the U.S. Congress is unlikely to ever lift a punishing economic embargo on Cuba unless the Communist government improved its human rights record".³⁹⁶ Regarding the initial prisoner exchange between U.S. and Cuba, the U.S. Ambassador to the Holy See had also commented "...this is what we as a government want to happen: that there be visible signs of liberties in that country... then the investments are going to start and the embargo being lifted".³⁹⁷ Relatedly, the Cuban Government announced in early September 2015 that they would release over 3500 prisoners as a "goodwill gesture" ahead of Francis' visit,³⁹⁸ accordingly understood as another example of Vatican's positive influence on U.S.-Cuban relations. Furthermore, the recent arrival of the U.S. Secretary of Commerce Penny Pritzker in Havana on the 6th October 2015 for embargo talks holds positive connotation for progression towards a complete normalisation of U.S. - Cuban relations,³⁹⁹ where the Vatican hopes that an end to the embargo will bring with it "a greater openness from the point of view of freedom and human rights".⁴⁰⁰

³⁹⁵ Pullella.

³⁹⁶ Pullella.

³⁹⁷ Vatican Radio, "Papal Speech to Diplomats: US Ambassador on Cuba, Guantanamo, Paris", 13.01.2015, <http://www.news.va/en/news/papal-speech-to-diplomats-us-ambassador-on-cuba-2>, (accessed on 06.10.2015).

³⁹⁸ BBC.com, "US Commerce Secretary Pritzker in Cuba for Embargo Talks", 6.10.2015 (Pritzker), <http://www.bbc.com/news/world-latin-america-34220944>, (accessed on 06.10.2015).

³⁹⁹ BBC.com, Pritzker.

⁴⁰⁰ Chiacu and Kerry.

- In an interview with Vatican Television, the Vatican Secretary of State Pietro Parolin notes "It is hoped ... that a measure like this (ending the embargo) will also bring with it a greater openness from the point of view of freedom and human rights,"

CONCLUSION

In *Foreign Policy: Theories, Actors and Cases*, Doyle sets forth some general liberal principles that should guide a state's foreign policy towards both liberal and non-liberal worlds, if a concern for "protecting and expanding the range of international freedom" is to shape its strategic aims.⁴⁰¹ In certain areas some overlaps with the Vatican's own foreign policy approach may be observed, especially where the liberal aspiration of "harmony amongst international actors"⁴⁰² coincides with the Vatican's own predisposition towards fostering a "culture of peace".⁴⁰³ This thesis subsequently attributes these overlaps to a mutually fundamental concern for the individual. Under the liberal worldview this is "a belief in the importance of moral freedom, of the right to be treated and a duty to treat others as ethical subjects, and not as objects or means only",⁴⁰⁴ and as we saw in *Provenance*, the Vatican maintains relations with individual countries based on certain priorities and principles, such as the priority of the human person, his (or her) dignity, and his (or her) rights.⁴⁰⁵ Furthermore, the strategies which Doyle proposes seek the preservation and expansion of liberal communities without violating liberal principles or bankrupting the liberal state.⁴⁰⁶ Thus one can again understand why similarities may exist with the Vatican's own approach, where the Vatican strives to implement its peaceful global objectives whilst upholding its own Catholic principles and operating under the constraint of considerably limited material resources.

In closing its observations therefore, this thesis moves to highlight these strategic overlaps. The value here is that the highlighted strategies may also be adapted so that they are useful to other states operating under material constraints (such as small or developing nations), where intangible resources should be harnessed to enhance their influence in world politics, in pursuit of their own peaceful objectives.

⁴⁰¹ Doyle, p. 62.

⁴⁰² Neack, p. 16.

⁴⁰³ Tauran.

⁴⁰⁴ Doyle, p. 50.

⁴⁰⁵ Tauran.

⁴⁰⁶ Doyle, p. 62.

Under Doyle's principle of *preservation*, there is an overarching emphasis on mitigation of tensions, under which the management of alliances on a multilateral basis plays an important role in protecting the liberal community.⁴⁰⁷ To this end this study has already discussed the importance of the Vatican's relations with governmental organizations, such as those with the United Nations and its Agencies, the Council of Europe, the European Union, the Organization for Security and Cooperation in Europe, the Organization of American States, and the Organization for African Unity. Amongst these especially, the United Nations was underscored as a "privileged stage" which the Holy See uses to reinforce its position as a moral authority whilst addressing its global concerns based on the values that it represents, defends, and promotes.⁴⁰⁸ In strategic terms then, as was asserted in *Provenance*, it is important to note that adopting a multilateral disposition which considers multilateral fora in response to threats or concerns also communicates a respect for international law, institutions and norms. This in turn radiates admirable characteristics such as dependability and legitimacy, which may subsequently increase the ability of states to establish their peaceful objectives.

Doyle's perspective furthermore views foreign policies which convey a commitment to collective responsibility as conducive towards the creation of an atmosphere that is suited towards multilateral problem solving.⁴⁰⁹ In highlighting the principle of the common good, which plays an important role where the Vatican's emphasis on the shared promotion of the welfare of the international community is concerned, Chapter Three also observed that the Vatican engages not only in collaborative efforts with governmental organizations, but with non-governmental organizations as well. A positive engagement with NGOs may therefore prove to be a useful strategic tool for other materially constrained states that wish to better position themselves on the world stage in pursuit of their peaceful objectives. Especially because, as discussed, NGOs have the ability to alter public perceptions and attract followers,⁴¹⁰ it is important for other governments to take them into account.

⁴⁰⁷ Doyle, p. 65.

⁴⁰⁸ Tomasi.

⁴⁰⁹ Doyle, p. 66.

⁴¹⁰ Nye, *Soft Power*, p. 87.

As we have already seen in Chapter One, under the liberal conception, liberal democratic political systems are regarded as offering the means for facilitating the “greatest collective domain of freedom for equal individuals”.⁴¹¹ If the above is considered alongside the liberal conception of a separate zone of peace that exists between liberal states,⁴¹² this helps us to understand why Doyle’s principle of *expansion* focuses on fostering the development, stability, and spread of liberal democratic regimes.⁴¹³ Here, this dissertation has also discussed the Holy See’s “support to all institutions that foster democracy as the basis of political and social life” where “democracy means participation and co-responsibility”.⁴¹⁴ In a present day context, some examples of the Vatican’s support for democracy were highlighted including Francis’ 2014 calls to MEP’s in the European Parliament to keep democracy alive,⁴¹⁵ as well as his 2015 calls for consolidation of democracy in South America.⁴¹⁶ To this end, Doyle asserts that much of the potential success in policies designed to foster democracy rests on measures such as an active human rights diplomacy. A harmony with the Vatican’s perspective may again be noted along with previously discussed observations concerning John Paul’s ideas, that; “authentic” democracy needs to be supported by human rights values if it is to be fruitful.⁴¹⁷ For the Vatican, an active human rights diplomacy is one of the most valuable tools in the Pope’s repertoire, and a vital source of its influence. Here particularly, Chapter Four has detailed the Vatican’s focus on human rights issues during the U.S. - Cuban rapprochement process. With regards to strategic lessons that may be birthed therefore, the lessons are simple. In seeking to establish their peaceful objectives, materially constrained states should be aware of the value of an active human rights diplomacy, which may enhance their perceived image and legitimacy, and ultimately advance their foreign policy objectives. In the case of materially constrained states who themselves are human rights violators, an understanding of the potential benefits

⁴¹¹ Macmillan, p. 22.

⁴¹² Doyle, pp. 51-59.

- According to Doyle, the spread of liberal democratic regimes takes place through both forceful and non-violent means. A zone of peace exists among liberal states, but not always between liberal and non-liberal states. However, here he also observes that it is not always the non-liberal ones who initiate wars.

⁴¹³ Doyle. p. 50.

⁴¹⁴ Tauran.

⁴¹⁵ RTE News, Parliament.

⁴¹⁶ Püllella.

⁴¹⁷ Tauran.

derived from a positive image and legitimacy should serve as a motivational factor towards the activation of policies directed at rectifying such violations. Furthermore, in seeking to establish their peaceful objectives, materially constrained states should also accord value to commonly supported institutions (i.e. democratic institutions with an emphasis on shared responsibility), as these institutions may encourage other countries to “channel or limit their activities” in ways that they may prefer without requiring the use of as many costly “carrots and sticks”.⁴¹⁸

Under the principle of *inspiration*, Doyle observes the significant role that emulation plays where the “simplest programme for liberal expansion is to be the “City on a Hill”.⁴¹⁹ In this vein, he posits that liberalism taps into the “chords of common humanity” which lend confidence that all may one day follow a “similar path towards liberation”, and in doing so allow for “appropriate national and cultural differences”.⁴²⁰ Importantly, he argues that peoples will *liberate themselves by modernizing themselves* and therefore proposes that an effective strategy is simply to “live up to their own principles at home, while waiting for others to modernize themselves”.⁴²¹ Thus far, in pursuit of furthering an understanding of Vatican’s influence in world politics, this thesis has made frequent reference to conceptions of soft power where soft power “highlights the influence that derives from a more intangible and enlightened source: a positive image in world affairs that endears nations to other nations in the world polity”.⁴²² There has therefore been a similar focus on the importance of emulation,⁴²³ under which leadership does not only involve issuing commands, but also leading by example and attracting others to do what you want. Here, it was also argued that [1] positive efforts to lead by example are set forth by Francis, (e.g. through his ‘humble’ lifestyle, reform of the Vatican’s institutions, and promotion of peaceful political values etc.) and that [2] these efforts have essentially favourable connotations towards the Vatican’s soft power.

⁴¹⁸ Nye, *Soft Power*, p. 23.

⁴¹⁹ Doyle, p. 66.

⁴²⁰ Doyle, p. 66.

⁴²¹ Doyle, p. 66.

⁴²² Gallarotti, p. 9.

⁴²³ Gallarotti, p. 9.

- under soft power conceptions, the afore-mentioned “positive image” leads to admiration and respect, which “render nations that have soft power more endearing in the eyes of other nations” and may be so strong that other nations even attempt to emulate the policies of these “soft power nations”.

Accordingly then, it would also be prudent for the leadership of materially constrained states pursuing their own peaceful objectives to remain aware of the benefits which are derived from representing values which others may want to follow. This is because, as discussed, “the ability to establish preferences tends to be associated with intangible assets such as an attractive personality, culture, political values and institutions, and policies that are seen as legitimate or having moral authority”.⁴²⁴

To conclude, this thesis provides a recap of how investigations under the three key areas of *Past*, *Provenance* and *Process* have contributed towards achieving its primary objective of an improved understanding of the Vatican’s influence in world politics. Under the opening chapter, an argument which highlighted the important role that ideational elements play was made, consequently laying the groundwork for an approach that would utilize theories from both the liberal and constructivist worldviews, both of which support the argument that “ideas matter”. In accordance with constructivism’s emphasis upon the importance of history as well as ideas, norms and practices,⁴²⁵ the contextual background in Chapter Two then set forth a descriptive, historical account which highlighted the Vatican’s involvement in some key events in world politics over the preceding century. Given the aforementioned emphasis on ideational elements, this was done in collaboration with an exploration of the development of important ideas and principles in Catholic social thought and teaching which took place over the same period, where some tenets of Catholic Social thought were also introduced (e.g. solidarity, human dignity, subsidiarity and the common good). Chapter Three further recognized such principles as moral pillars of the values expressed through Catholic culture and the Vatican’s policies. To this end, it was argued that an understanding of these principles would not only be useful in helping to understand why the Vatican holds the particular political values that it does, but it would also contribute towards an overall understanding of the stimulation and creation of relations of attraction towards the Vatican, which have direct bearing on its capacity to achieve its

⁴²⁴ Nye, *Soft Power*, p. 19.

⁴²⁵ Reus-Smit. **p.207.**

- “if ideas, norms, and practices matter, and if they differ from one social context to another, then history in turn matters.”

preferred outcomes in world politics. In pursuit of this thesis' primary objective of an improved understanding of the Vatican's influence in world politics, Chapter Three's examination of the sources of the Vatican's influence subsequently expanded into observations regarding its domestic and international sources of soft power. Chapter Four then turned its attention towards the primary case study which detailed the Vatican's role in the recent Cuban-U.S thaw which was done in order to contribute towards an improved understanding of the *process* of the Vatican's influence. Here, through a series of positions, it was argued that: the relations of admiration and respect generated from the Vatican's positive image placed it in a favourable position to effectively initiate a series of conciliatory moves which encouraged dialogue and supported progression on the (interrelated) economic, humanitarian, ideological and diplomatic barriers that had previously dominated U.S.-Cuban relations, thereby contributing towards a thaw in relations between the two nations.

Before closing it would be prudent to emphasise that furthermore to conclusions reached during its case study, this thesis does not rashly assert the Vatican's 'sole responsibility' for the thaw in relations which occurred between the U.S and Cuba. Its intent is rather to emphasise the Vatican's critical and **contributing** role regarding the initiation of negotiations between the U.S and Cuba, a role which emanates from its soft power. Likewise, it should also be acknowledged that material (economic) factors such as the mutual trade losses between Cuba and the U.S. may have also played a significant role towards an improvement of U.S-Cuban relations. However, to this end this thesis would posit that underlying such material factors are the ideas which give them meaning and importance. For example, the U.S. had imposed an embargo on Cuba which remained unchanged for many decades. However, with the Vatican's recent actions undertaken in its role as a moral authority, the intercessions of Francis - who has established a reputation as a friend of the poor and advocate for the marginalised - serve to underscore the importance of the idea of human dignity in a present day context. Accordingly, the impact of the embargo on the everyday social wellbeing of 11.2 million Cuban citizens⁴²⁶ is highlighted, imparting a higher moral cost upon the U.S., which

⁴²⁶ World Population Review, "Cuba Population 2016", <http://worldpopulationreview.com/countries/cuba-population/>, (accessed on 06.10.2015).

vehemently portrays itself as a human rights champion on the world stage. Thus, a link to the Vatican's conciliatory role may once again be established.

Overall, research of this nature holds much potential in a present-day context where war and conflict is increasingly underscored by religion, and the pursuit of peace is becoming ever-more desperate. Embodying both state and Church, the Vatican fulfils many roles in such a world. Amongst these include its roles as a "focal point for a vast spiritual and cultural community, a symbol for a system of values and ideas," and "a coordinating secretariat for an expansive multinational bureaucracy".⁴²⁷ It is against this background, and through the fulfilment of these roles, that the Vatican has emerged as a major influential actor in world politics.

In closing then, it is worth restating that an understanding of the Vatican's influence should serve to inspire other small or materially constrained states, who wish to enhance their position on the world stage in pursuit of their own peaceful objectives. Most importantly, regard should be given to the Vatican's respect for international law, institutions and norms, where its commitment to 'the rules' radiates admirable characteristics such as dependability, legitimacy, sensitivity and a disposition against violence. This of course is significant because, a display of this general commitment "is the principal source of international soft power".⁴²⁸

⁴²⁷ Rostow.

- Amongst these include for example (according to Rostow) its roles as a "focal point for a vast spiritual and cultural community, a symbol for a system of values and ideas," and "a coordinating secretariat for an expansive multinational bureaucracy".

⁴²⁸ Gallarotti, p. 20.

REFERENCES

- Abdullah, Yasmin. "The Holy See at United Nations Conferences: State or Church", **Columbia Law Review**, vol. 96, no.7, 1996, pp. 1835-1875.
- Agence France-Presse. "Pope Francis offers US help in closing Guantanamo", 15.12. 2014, <http://news.yahoo.com/pope-francis-offers-us-help-closing-guantanamo-220007878.html>, (accessed on 11.12.2015).
- Aljazeera.com. "Pope Backs US-Cuba Reconciliation", 20.09.2015, <http://www.aljazeera.com/news/2015/09/visiting-cuba-pope-francis-reconciliation-150920061249362.html>, (accessed on 24.09.2015).
- Appleby, Scott. "Pope John Paul II", **Foreign Policy**, no. 119, 2000, pp.12-25.
- Baker, Peter and Davis, Julie. "A Secretive Path to Raising U.S. Flag in Cuba", **The New York Times**, 13.08 2015, http://www.nytimes.com/2015/08/14/world/americas/a-secretive-path-to-raising-us-flag-in-cuba.html?_r=0, (accessed on 02.09.2015).
- BBC.com. "Timeline: US-Cuba Relations", 11.10.2012, <http://www.bbc.com/news/world-latin-america-12159943>, (accessed on 02.09.2015).
- BBC.com. "Pope Francis Urges Church to Focus on Helping Poor", 4.10.2013, <http://www.bbc.com/news/world-europe-24391800>, (accessed on 16.10.15).
- BBC.com. "The Vatican's Child Abuse Response", 11.04.2014, <http://www.bbc.com/news/world-europe-25757218>, (accessed on 16.10.2015).
- BBC.com. "Vatican Bank Sees a 20-Fold Increase in Earnings", 25.05.2015, <http://www.bbc.com/news/business-32879571>, (accessed on 20.07.2015).
- BBC.com. "Pope Francis Blames Human Selfishness for Global Warming", 18.06.2015, <http://www.bbc.com/news/world-europe-33182065>, (accessed on 24.06.2015).
- BBC.com. "US Commerce Secretary Pritzker in Cuba for Embargo Talks", 6.10.2015, <http://www.bbc.com/news/world-latin-america-34220944>, (accessed on 06.10.2015).
- BBC.com. "Migrant Crisis: Activist Convoy Drives to Hungary", 17.10.2015, <http://www.bbc.com/news/world-europe-34166882>, (accessed on 16.10.15).
- BBC.com. "Cuba to Release 3,500 Prisoners ahead of Visit by Pope", 11.09.2015, <http://www.bbc.com/news/world-latin-america-34220944>, (accessed on 13.09.2015).
- Benedict XVI. "Words of his Holiness Benedict XVI Havana at José Martí International Airport", 28.03.2012, http://w2.vatican.va/content/benedict-xvi/en/speeches/2012/march/documents/hf_ben-xvi_spe_20120328_congado-cuba.html, (accessed on 29.09.2015).
- Boulton, Ralph. "U.S. Asks Vatican for Help with Guantanamo Inmates", **Reuters**, 15.12.2014, <http://www.reuters.com/article/2014/12/15/us-pope-kerry-idUSKBN0JT1WI20141215>, (accessed on 03.10.2015).
- Cara.georgetown.edu. "Frequently Requested Church Statistics", <http://cara.georgetown.edu/caraservices/requestedchurchstats.html>, (accessed on 03.08.2015).
- Capital Flows. "It's Time for the U.S. To End Its Senseless Embargo of Cuba", **Forbes**, 26.01.2013, <http://www.forbes.com/sites/realspin/2013/01/16/its-time-for-the-u-s-to-end-its-senseless-embargo-of-cuba/#3828ce875430>, (accessed on 02.09.2015).
- Catholic Church. "Catechism of the Catholic Church", http://www.vatican.va/archive/ccc_css/archive/catechism/p3s1c2a1.htm, (accessed on 25.06.2015).
- Catholic News Service. "Number of Vatican Museums' Visitors Tops 5 Million", 01.11.2012, <http://www.catholicnews.com/services/englishnews/2012/news-briefs-cns-1200139.cfm>, (accessed on 16.07.2015).
- Catholic.org.nz. "Principles of Catholic Social Teaching", <http://www.catholic.org.nz/social-action/dsp-default.cfm?loadref=62>, (accessed on 01.07.2015).
- Catholicsocialteaching.org. "Papal Encyclicals", <http://www.catholicsocialteaching.org.uk/principles/documents/>, (accessed on 24.06.2015).

- Catholicsocialteaching.org. "Human Dignity",
<http://www.catholicsocialteaching.org.uk/themes/human-dignity/>, (accessed on 24.06.2015).
- Catholicsocialteaching.org. "Principles of Catholic Social Teaching",
<http://www.catholicsocialteaching.org.uk/principles/info/>, (accessed on 01.07.2015).
- Center for Productive Law and Policy. "Church or State: The Holy See at the United Nations",
<http://www.population-security.org/crlp-94-07.html>, (accessed on 01.11.2015).
- Checkel, Jeffrey. "Constructivism and Foreign Policy", **Foreign Policy, Theories, Actors and Cases**, eds. Steve Smith, Amelia Hadfield and Tim Dunne, Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2008, pp. 71-82.
- Chiacu, Doina and Francis Kerry. "U.S. and Cuba: From Cold War Hostilities to a Historic Meeting", **Reuters**, 11.04.2015,
<http://www.reuters.com/article/2015/04/11/us-cuba-usa-events-idUSKBN0N20NN20150411>, (accessed on 05.10.2015).
- Chong, Alan. "The Catholic Church in International Politics", **E-International Relations**, 14.11.2013,
<http://www.e-ir.info/2013/11/14/the-catholic-church-in-international-politics/>, (accessed on 01.08.2015).
- CIA.gov. "Holy See (Vatican City)".
<https://www.cia.gov/library/publications/the-world-factbook/geos/vt.html>, (accessed on 20.07.2015).
- Clement, Scott. "Poll: Support Increases for Lifting Cuba Embargo, Travel Restrictions", **The Washington Post**, 23.12.2014,
<http://www.washingtonpost.com/news/the-fix/wp/2014/12/23/poll-support-increases-for-lifting-cuba-embargo-travel-restrictions/>, (accessed on 04.09.2015).
- Corley, Felix. "Obituary: Cardinal Agostino Casaroli", **The Independent**, 23.10.2011,
<http://www.independent.co.uk/arts-entertainment/obituary-cardinal-agostino-casaroli-1163946.html>, (accessed on 24.06.2015).
- Davies, Lizzy. "Pope Francis Leaves for Brazil Visit – Carrying His Own Bag", **The Guardian**, 22.07.2013,
<http://www.theguardian.com/world/2013/jul/22/pope-francis-leaves-brazil-visit>, (accessed on 14.07.2015).
- Dias, Elizabeth. "Pope Francis Urges Climate Change Action in Encyclical", **Time**, 18.06.2015,
<http://time.com/3925736/pope-francis-climate-change-encyclical-laudato-si/>, (accessed on 20.06.2015).
- Donati, Pierpaolo. "Discovering the Relational Character of the Common Good", **Pursuing the Common Good: How Solidarity and Subsidiarity Can work Together**, The Proceedings of the 14th Plenary Session of the Pontifical Academy of Social Sciences, Vatican City, 2-6.05.2008, pp. 659-683.
- Doyle, Michael. "Liberalism and Foreign Policy", **Foreign Policy, Theories, Actors and Cases**, eds. Steve Smith, Amelia Hadfield and Tim Dunne, Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2008, pp. 49-70.
- Dyer, Geoff. "U.S Cuba Script Written in Papal Library", **Financial Times**, 17.12.2014,
<http://www.ft.com/intl/cms/s/0/80bc51e8-863f-11e4-b24800144feabdc0.html#axzz3nIwLeB7f>, (accessed on 01.10.2015).
- Encyclopaedia Britannica. "The Modern Papacy",
<http://global.britannica.com/topic/papacy/The-modern-papacy>, (accessed on 08.07.2015).
- Encyclopaedia Britannica. "Liberation Theology",
<http://global.britannica.com/topic/liberation-theology>, (accessed on 26.08.2015).
- Epstein, Adam. "A Timeline of US-Cuba Relations Since the Cuban Revolution", **Quartz**, 17.12.2014,
<http://qz.com/314271/a-timeline-of-us-cuban-relations-since-the-cuban-revolution/>, (accessed on 02.09.2015).
- Esdaille, Rob. "2000 Years of Catholic Ethics",
<http://www.catholicsocialteaching.org.uk/principles/history/>, (accessed on 08.07.2015).
- Evans, Ernest. "The Vatican's Foreign Policy after the Collapse of Soviet Communism", **World Affairs Institute**, vol. 155, no. 1, 1992, pp. 27-30.

- Fox, Jonathan and Shmuel Sandler. **Bringing Religion into International Relations**. New York: Palgrave-Macmillan, 2004.
- Francis I. "Letter of Pope Francis to H. E. Mr. Vladimir Putin, President of the Russian Federation, on the Occasion Of The G20 St. Petersburg Summit", 4.09.2013, (Putin), https://w2.vatican.va/content/francesco/en/letters/2013/documents/papa-francesco_20130904_putin-g20.html, (accessed on, 12.12.2015).
- Francis I. "Address of His Holiness Pope Francis to the Members of the Diplomatic Corps Accredited to the Holy See", 12.01.2015, http://w2.vatican.va/content/francesco/en/speeches/2015/january/documents/papa-francesco_20150112_corpo-diplomatico.html, (accessed on 20.07.2015).
- Gallarotti, Giulio. "Soft power: What it is, Why it's Important, and the Conditions under which it Can Be Effectively Used", **Division II Faculty Publications**, paper 57, 2011.
- GlobalSecurity.org. "Religion in Cuba", <http://www.globalsecurity.org/military/world/cuba/religion.htm>, (accessed on 03.09.2015).
- Gomichon, Maxime. "*Joseph Nye on Soft Power*", **E-International Relations**, 8.03.2013, <http://www.e-ir.info/2013/03/08/joseph-nye-on-soft-power/>, (accessed on 01.08.2015).
- Greenwall, Andrew. "Catholic Social Doctrine: What Does the Church Teach About Democracy and Values?" **Catholic Online**, 27.03.2012, <http://www.catholic.org/news/politics/story.php?id=45377>, (accessed on 17.07.2015).
- Harris, Elise. "Holy Week Is About Humility – There Is No Other Way, Pope Says", **Catholic News Agency**, 29.03.2015, <http://www.catholicnewsagency.com/news/holy-week-is-about-humility-there-is-no-other-way-pope-says-42218/>, (accessed on 14.07.2015).
- Hehir, Bryan. "Papal Foreign Policy", **Foreign Policy**, vol. 78, 1990, pp. 26-48.
- Hermann, Margaret. "Content Analysis", **Qualitative Methods in International Relations: A Pluralist Guide**, eds. Audie Klotz and Deepa Prakesh, New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2008, pp. 151-167.
- Hittinger, Russel. "The Coherence of the Four Basic Principles of Catholic Social Doctrine - An Interpretation", **Pursuing the Common Good: How Solidarity and Subsidiarity Can work Together**, The Proceedings of the 14th Plenary Session of the Pontifical Academy of Social Sciences, Vatican City, 2-6.05.2008, pp. 75-123.
- Hooper, John. "Barack Obama has first meeting with Pope Francis at Vatican", **The Guardian**, 27 March 2014, <http://www.theguardian.com/world/2014/mar/27/barack-obama-pope-francis-vatican>, (accessed on 01.10.2015).
- John XXIII. Encyclical Letter "Pacem in Terris", 11.04.1963, http://w2.vatican.va/content/johnxxiii/en/encyclicals/documents/hf_jxxiii_enc_11041963_pacem.html, (accessed on 01.07.2015).
- Kowalewski, David. "The Catholic Church and the Cuban Regime", **Religion in Communist Lands**, vol. 11, no. 1, 2009, pp. 67-72.
- Lee, Brianna and Danielle Renwick. "U.S.-Cuba Relations", **Council on Foreign Relations**, 04.08.2015, <http://www.cfr.org/cuba/us-cuba-relations/p11113>, (accessed on 02.09.2015).
- Lopez, Kathryn. "Laudato Si and the Common Good", **National Review**, 22.06.2015, <http://www.nationalreview.com/article/420100/laudato-si-and-common-good-kathryn-jean-lopez>, (accessed on 20.06.2015).
- Lupovici, Amir. "Constructivist methods: A Plea and Manifesto for Pluralism", **Review of International Studies**, vol.35, 2009, pp 195-218.
- Macmillan, John. "Liberal Internationalism", **International Relations Theory for the Twenty-First Century**, ed. Martin Griffiths, New York: Routledge, 2007, pp. 21-34.
- Marino, Soraya. "U.S- Cuban Perspectives during the Clinton Administration", **Latin American Perspectives**, vol. 29, 2002, no. 4, pp 47-76.

- Martin, Diarmuid. "Comment on Hittinger's 'The Coherence of the Four Basic Principles of Catholic Social Doctrine- an Interpretation'". **Pursuing the Common Good: How Solidarity and Subsidiarity Can work Together**, The Proceedings of the 14th Plenary Session of the Pontifical Academy of Social Sciences. Vatican City. 2-6.05.2008, pp. 124-131.
- Martino, Renato. "Press Conference for the Presentation of the Compendium of the Social Doctrine of the Church", 25.10.2004,
http://www.vatican.va/roman_curia/pontifical_councils/justpeace/documents/rc_pc_justpeace_doc_20041025_compendio-dottrina-sociale_en.html, (accessed on 01.10.2015).
- Mayer, Catherine. "Pope Urges 'Aged and Weary' Europe to Accept Migrants and Reject Hunger", **Time**, 25.11.2014,
<http://time.com/3604648/pope-francis-european-parliament/>, (accessed on 01.10.2015).
- Minnerath, Roland. "The Fundamental Principles of Social Doctrine. The Issue of their Interpretation", **Pursuing the Common Good: How Solidarity and Subsidiarity Can work Together**, The Proceedings of the 14th Plenary Session of the Pontifical Academy of Social Sciences, Vatican City, 2-6.05.2008, pp. 45-56.
- Moravcsik, Andrew. "Liberal International Relations Theory: A Scientific assessment", **Progress in International Relations Theory: Appraising the Field**, eds. Colin Elman and Miriam Elman, Massachussets: MIT Press, 2003, pp.159-205.
- Neack, Laura. **The New Foreign Policy: Power Seeking in a Globalized Era**, New York: Rowman and Littlefield Publishers, 2008.
- News.va, "Pope Welcomes U.S. and Cuban Moves to Normalise Relations", 17.12.2014,
<http://www.news.va/en/news/pope-welcomes-us-and-cuban-moves-to-normalise-rela>, (accessed on 03.09.2015).
- Nye, Joseph. "Soft Power", **Foreign Policy**, no. 80, 1990, pp.153-171.
- Nye, Joseph. **Soft Power: The Means to Success in World Politics**, (e-book), New York: PublicAffairs Publishers, 2004.
- Nye, Joseph. "Think Again: Soft Power", **Foreign Policy**, 23.02.2006,
<http://foreignpolicy.com/2006/02/23/think-again-soft-power/>, (accessed on 09.10.2015).
- Obama, Barack. "Statement by the President on Cuba Policy Changes", 17.12.2014,
<https://www.whitehouse.gov/the-press-office/2014/12/17/statement-president-cuba-policy-changes>, (accessed on 05.09.2015).
- Pallaver, Matteo. **Power and its forms: Hard, Soft, Smart** (MPhil Dissertation), London School of Economics, London, 2011.
- Parnass, Sarah. "By the Numbers: Catholics in America", **ABC News**, 28.02.2013,
<http://abcnews.go.com/Politics/numbers-catholics-america/story?id=18619248>, (accessed on 03.09.2015).
- Pbs.org. "Cuba/United States Timeline", 20.09.2002,
<http://www.pbs.org/now/politics/cubatimeline.html>, (accessed on 02.09.2015).
- Pentin, "The Pope as Diplomat". **Foreign Affairs**, 27.02.2013.
<https://www.foreignaffairs.com/articles/2013-02-27/pope-diplomat>, (accessed on 30.08.2015).
- Pew Research Center. "Pope Francis' Image Positive in Much of the World", 11.12.2014,
<http://www.pewglobal.org/2014/12/11/pope-francis-image-positive-in-much-of-world/>, (accessed on 20.06.2015).
- Pianigiani, Gaia and Jim Yardley. "Pope Francis Is Credited With a Crucial Role in U.S.-Cuba Agreement", **The New York Times**, 17.12.2014,
http://www.nytimes.com/2014/12/18/world/americas/breakthrough-on-cuba-highlights-popes-role-as-diplomatic-broker.html?_r=0, (accessed on 04.09.2015).
- Pius XI. "Quadragesimo Anno", 1931,
http://w2.vatican.va/content/piusxi/en/encyclicals/documents/hf_pxi_enc_19310515_quadragesimo-anno.html, (accessed on 08.07.2015).
- Politi, James. "How Pope Francis Helped Melt the US-Cuba Freeze", **The Financial Times**, 19.12.2014,
<http://www.ft.com/intl/cms/s/0/8ed59cf8-876b-11e4-8c91-00144feabdc0.html#axzz3lPxJEXm>, (accessed on 04.09.2015).

- Pontifical Academy of Sciences. "Blessed John XXIII", <http://www.casinapioiv.va/content/accademia/en/magisterium/johnxxiii.html>, (accessed on 01.09.2015).
- Pontifical Council for Justice and Peace (ed.). "Introduction", **Compendium of the Social Doctrine of the Church**, 2004, http://www.vatican.va/roman_curia/pontifical_councils/justpeace/documents/rc_pc_justpeace_doc_20060526_compendio-dott-soc_en.html#The foundation of political authority, (accessed on 01.10.2015).
- Pullella, Philip. "Pope Urges Paraguay to Consolidate Democracy, End Drug Trade, Graft", **Reuters**, 10.07.2015, <http://www.reuters.com/article/2015/07/10/us-pope-latam-paraguay-idUSKCN0PK2ML20150710>, (accessed on 19.07.2015).
- Rayman, Noah. "5 Leadership Lessons You Can Learn From Pope Francis", **Time**, 10.03.2015, <http://time.com/3737887/pope-francis-leadership-lessons/>, (accessed on 01.07.2015).
- Reus-Smit, Christian. "Constructivism", **Theories of International Relations**, eds. Scott Burchill, Andrew Linklater, Richard Devetak, Jack Donnelly, Matthew Paterson, Christian Reus-Smit and Jacqui True, New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2005, pp. 188-212.
- Reuters. "The U.S. is asking the Vatican for Help with Guantanamo Inmates", **Huffington Post**, 14.02.2015, http://www.huffingtonpost.com/2014/12/15/us-vatican-guantanamo_n_6328094.html, (accessed on 04.09.2015).
- Roberts, Dan. "Obama and Raúl Castro Thank Pope for Breakthrough in US-Cuba Relations", **The Guardian**, 17.12.2014, <http://www.theguardian.com/world/2014/dec/17/us-cuba-diplomatic-relations-obama-raul-castro>, (accessed on 01.09.2015).
- Roberts, Dan. "Spies, Artificial Insemination and the Pope: How Cuba Came in from the Cold", **The Guardian**, 26.04.2015, <http://www.theguardian.com/world/2015/apr/26/usa-cuba-relations-barack-obama-pope-francis-spies>, (accessed on 01.10.2015).
- Roberts, Jay. "Sovereignty", **Towson**, <http://www.towson.edu/polsci/irencyc/sovereign.htm>, (accessed on 01.11.2015).
- Rostow, Eugene. "Speech on the Role of the Vatican in the Modern World", **Global Catholic Network**, 27.03.1968, <https://www.ewtn.com/library/HUMANITY/VATMOD.HTM>Rostow, (accessed on 01.07.2015).
- RTE News. "Hidden Death Penalty: Pope Francis Calls for End to Life Sentences", 24.10.2014, <https://www.rte.com/news/198772-pope-francis-death-penalty-torture/>, (accessed on 11.12.2015).
- RTE News, "Pope Criticises 'Elderly' Europe in Speech to Parliament", 25.11.2014, <http://www.rte.ie/news/2014/1125/662250-pope-francis/>, (accessed 19.07.2015).
- Scammell, Rosie. "Castro Thanks Pope Francis for Brokering Thaw between Cuba and US", **The Guardian**, 10.05.2015, <http://www.theguardian.com/world/2015/may/10/pope-meets-cuban-president-raul-castro>, (accessed on 09.12.2015).
- Siddiqui, Sabrina. "Obama to Remove Cuba from List of State Sponsors of Terrorism", **The Guardian**, 15.04.2015, <http://www.theguardian.com/us-news/2015/apr/14/obama-remove-cuba-list-state-sponsors-terrorism>, (accessed on 06.10.2015).
- Sifferlin, Alexandra. "Pope Francis Apologizes for Vatican Scandals", **Time**, 14.10.2015, <http://time.com/4073933/pope-francis-apologizes-vatican/>, (accessed on 16.10.2015).
- Squires, Nick. "Pope Francis Shunned Official Papal Apartments to Live Normal Life", **The Telegraph**, 29.05.2013, <http://www.telegraph.co.uk/news/worldnews/the-pope/10086876/Pope-Francis-shunned-official-papal-apartments-to-live-normal-life.html>, (accessed on 14.07.2015).

- Squires, Nick. "Pope Francis Brokered US-Cuba Deal at Secret Vatican Meetings", **The Telegraph**, 17.12.2014,
<http://www.telegraph.co.uk/news/worldnews/the-pope/11300391/Pope-Francis-brokered-US-Cuba-deal-at-secret-Vatican-meetings.html>, (accessed on 03.10.2015).
- Tauran, Jean. "Lecture by Archbishop Jean-Louis Tauran on the Theme of the Presence of the Holy-See in the International Organizations", 22.04.2002,
http://www.vatican.va/roman_curia/secretariat_state/documents/rc_seg-st_doc_20020422_tauran_en.html, (accessed on 19.07.2015).
- Teslik, Lee. "Pope Benedict's First Twelve Months", **Council on Foreign Relations**, 04.05 2006,
<http://www.cfr.org/religion/pope-benedicts-first-twelve-months/p10595>, (accessed on 20.06.2015).
- Tomasi, Silvano. "The Representation of the Catholic Church at the United Nations in Geneva", **International Catholic Organizations and Catholic Inspired NGO's: Their Contribution to the Building of the International Community**, Chambesy: MathiasNebel, 2012, pp.11-20.
- Tomasi, Silvano. "Why is the Holy See Engaged in International Life?", **International Catholic Organizations and Catholic Inspired NGO's: Their Contribution to the Building of the International Community**, Chambesy: MathiasNebel, 2012, pp. 37-44.
- Tornielli. "The Help of the Church in the Thaw in Relations between the US and Cuba", **The Vatican Insider**, 5.09.2015,
<http://vaticaninsider.lastampa.it/en/the-vatican/detail/articolo/francesco-francisco-francis-castro-40964/>, (accessed on 05.09.2015).
- Trotta, Daniel. "Pope's Visit to Cuba Raises Prospect of Human Rights Friction", **Reuters**, 18 September 2015.
<http://www.reuters.com/article/2015/09/18/us-pope-cuba-idUSKCN0R11IJ20150918>, (accessed on 29.09.2015).
- UNESCO. "Vatican City".
<http://whc.unesco.org/en/list/286>, (accessed on 17.07.2015).
- U.S. Department of State. "The Cuban Missile Crises",
<https://history.state.gov/departmenthistory/short-history/cubanmissile>, (accessed on 10.01.2016).
- Vatican Radio. "Cardinal Parolin: on Holy See's role in US/Cuba Agreement ", 18.12.2014,
http://en.radiovaticana.va/news/2014/12/18/cardinal_parolin_on_holy_see%E2%80%99s_role_in_us_cuba_agreement/1115269, (accessed on 26.09.2015).
- Vatican Radio. "Papal Speech to Diplomats: US Ambassador on Cuba, Guantanamo, Paris", 13.01.2015,
<http://www.news.va/en/news/papal-speech-to-diplomats-us-ambassador-on-cuba-2>, (accessed on 06.10.2015).
- Vatican City State. "Population",
<http://www.vaticanstate.va/content/vaticanstate/en/stato-e-governo/note-general/popolazione.html>, (accessed on 01.11.2015). VOA News, "Pope Francis Warns Cubans of Dangers of Ideology, Meets with Fidel Castro", 20.09.2015.
- VOA News. "Pope Francis Warns Cubans of Dangers of Ideology, Meets with Fidel Castro", 20.09.2015.
<http://www.voanews.com/content/pope-to-celebrate-mass-in-havanas-communist-inspired-shrine/2971107.html>, (accessed on 27.09.2015).
- Wendt, Alexander. "Anarchy is what States Make of it: The Social Construction of Power Politics", **International Organization**, vol. 46, no. 2, 1992, pp. 391-425.
- Wendt, Alexander. "Constructing International Politics", **International Security**, vol. 20, no. 1, 2005, pp. 71-81.
- Wiley, David. "Popular Pope Francis Takes Own Path in Vatican", **BBC News**, 24.12.2014,
<http://www.bbc.com/news/world-europe-30528913>, (accessed on 16.10.2015).
- World Population Review. "Cuba Population 2016",
<http://worldpopulationreview.com/countries/cuba-population/>, (accessed on 06.10.2015).